Imaeva, AE; Balanova, Yu A; Kontsevaya, AV; Kapustina, AV; Duplyakov, DV; Malysheva, OH; Osipova, IV; Petrichko, TA; Kropanin, GI; Kasimov, RA; +2 more... Leon, DA; McKee, M; (2018) Availability and Affordability of Medicines for the Treatment of Cardiovascular Diseases in Pharmacies in Six Regions of the Russian Federation. Rational Pharmacotherapy in Cardiology, 14 (6). pp. 804-815. ISSN 1819-6446 DOI: https://doi.org/10.20996/1819-6446-2018-14-6-804-815

Downloaded from: http://researchonline.lshtm.ac.uk/id/eprint/4650717/

DOI: https://doi.org/10.20996/1819-6446-2018-14-6-804-815

Usage Guidelines:

Please refer to usage guidelines at https://researchonline.lshtm.ac.uk/policies.html or alternatively contact researchonline@lshtm.ac.uk.

Available under license: http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/2.5/
Availability and Affordability of Medicines for the Treatment of Cardiovascular Diseases in Pharmacies in Six Regions of the Russian Federation

Asiia E. Imaeva1*, Yulia A. Balanova1, Anna V. Kontsevaya1, Anna V. Kapustina1, Dmitry V. Duplyakov2, Olga H. Malysheva3, Irina V. Ospova4, Tatiana A. Petrichko5, Georgiy I. Kropanin6, Riza A. Kasimov7, David A. Leon8,9, Martin McKee8 on behalf of participants of the study “Monitoring the Availability and Affordability of Medicines for the Treatment of Cardiovascular Diseases in Several Regions of the Russian Federation”

1 National Medical Research Center for Preventive Medicine. Petrovsky per. 10, Moscow, 101990 Russia
2 Samara Regional Cardiology Clinic. Aerodromnaya ul. 43, Samara, 443070 Russia
3 Medical Information-Analytical Centre. Herzena ul. 49, Kirov, 610017 Russia
4 Altai State Medical University. Lenina prosp. 40, Barnaul, 656038 Russia
5 Postgraduate Institute for Public Health Workers. Krasnodarskaya ul. 9, Khabarovsk, 680009 Russia
6 Regional Center for Medical Prevention. Gubkina ul. 15V, Belgorod, 308033 Russia
7 Vologda Regional Center of Medical Preventive Care. Mira ul. 9, Vologda, 160000 Russia
8 London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine. Keppel Street, London WC1E 7HT, UK
9 The University of Tromso – The Arctic University of Norway. Hansen Hansen Road 18, Tromso, Norway


Aim. To evaluate the availability and affordability of medicines used to treat of cardiovascular diseases (CVD) in several regions of the Russian Federation with different climatic, geographic, economic and demographic characteristics.

Material and methods. The study was conducted in 6 regional capitals, chosen to differ in geographically, economically, and demographically. In each city, 5 pharmacies providing free medicines to certain categories of citizens (beneficiaries) and 5 private pharmacies serving anyone were selected at random. Medicine availability was assessed in all pharmacies, along with price only in the private pharmacies. Data were obtained for both original drug and appropriate generics. A list of 25 of the most frequently prescribed medicines for cardiovascular diseases was compiled.

Results. Some general findings emerged. With the existence of a generic drug, the original drug was not available in the pharmacy supplying beneficiaries. Diuretics, as well as some ACE inhibitors, are not available in a number of pharmacies for beneficiaries. Enalapril in most licensed pharmacies is represented by generics, lisinopril in a number of cities is represented by both the original drug and generics. The presence of sartans was much lower than ACE inhibitors. Bisoprolol was most common beta-blocker. Calcium antagonists: if amlodipine was present in all licensed pharmacies, at list as generic, then nifedipine was not available in many licensed pharmacies. Among antplatelet agents, aspirin was available in most pharmacies, and clopidogrel was mostly represented by generics. As for statins, only simvastatin could be found in almost all pharmacies. When analyzing the cost of drugs in licensed pharmacies, it was found that drugs containing furosemide are the cheapest among generics – about 17 rubles. The most expensive treatment with generics of rosuvastatin – about 4,374 rubles a month. The most expensive original medicine was also rosuvastatin – about 4,500 rubles for 30 tablets, the cheapest – the original drug of furosemide – about 35 rubles. On average, the cost of CVD treatment with major classes of drugs, including ACE inhibitor, beta-blocker, antplatelet drug and statin, is 1,921.9 rubles per month.

Conclusion. The basic cardiovascular medicines were characterized by a relatively high availability in 6 regions of the Russian Federation included in the analysis both by the criterion of the availability of drugs and by the criterion of the minimum price.

Keywords: availability of medicines, affordability of medicines, treatment of cardiovascular diseases, pharmacies for beneficiaries, licensed pharmacies.


Доступность препарата для лечения сердечно-сосудистых заболеваний в аптеках шести регионов Российской Федерации

Асия Эмверовна Имаева1*, Юлия Андреевна Баланова1, Анна Васильевна Концевая1, Анна Владимировна Капустина1, Дмитрий Викторович Дупляков2, Ольга Герольдовна Малышева3, Ирина Владимировна Оспова4, Татьяна Алексеевна Петричко5, Георгий Иванович Кропанин6, Риза Ахмедзакиевич Касимов7, Дэвид Леон8,9, Мартин МакКи8 от имени участников исследования «Мониторинг доступности препаратов для лечения сердечно-сосудистых заболеваний в нескольких регионах Российской Федерации»

1 Национальный медицинский исследовательский центр профилактической медицины. Россия, 101990, Москва, Петровский пер., 10
2 Самарский областной клинический кардиологический диспансер. Россия, 443070, Самара, ул. Аэродромная, 43
3 Медицинский информационно-аналитический центр. Россия, 610017, Киров, ул. Герцен, 49
4 Алтайский государственный медицинский университет. Россия, 656038, Барнаул, просп. Ленина, 40
5 Институт повышения квалификации специалистов здравоохранения. Россия, 680009, Хабаровск, ул. Краснодарская, 9
The increase of life expectancy in the Russian Federation (RF) observed in recent decades is due to several factors, one of which is an increase in the survival rate of the elderly, due to a decrease in mortality from chronic noncommunicable diseases, especially from cardiovascular diseases (CVD) [1]. Nevertheless, the death rate in the RF is significantly higher in comparison with other countries with the same level of development [2].

Progress in reducing mortality reflects better diagnosis, treatment and control of major diseases such as arterial hypertension, heart failure and angina, as well as secondary prevention of coronary heart disease [3]. However, this progress varies, partly due to differences in the availability and affordability of drugs [4]. Affordability is the possibility to buy medicines by citizens who have no benefits.

State medical institutions in the RF provide free

Повышение ожидаемой продолжительности жизни в Российской Федерации (RF), наблюдаемое в последние десятилетия, объясняется несколькими факторами, один из которых — повышение выживаемости пожилых людей, обусловленное снижением смертности от хронических неинфекционных болезней, особенно от сердечно-сосудистых заболеваний (CСЗ) [1]. Тем не менее, показатель смертности в РФ значительно выше по сравнению с другими странами с таким же уровнем развития [2].

Исследования, проведенные в различных странах мира, показали, что подобные изменения были связаны с лучшей диагностикой, лечением и контролем основных заболеваний, таких как артериальная гипертония, сердечная недостаточность и стенокардия, а также с проведением различного рода мер по вторичной профилактике ишемической болезни сердца [3]. Однако было обнаружено, что существуют большие различия в эффективности мер, направленных на борьбу с ССЗ, что отчасти связано с различиями

*Corresponding Author (Автор, ответственный за переписку): Almaeva@gnicpm.ru

Received / Поступила: 24.07.2018
Accepted / Принята в печать: 29.10.2018
medical treatment to all patients but, once discharged, only some are entitled to free medications or at a 50% discount. Those eligible are defined in the Law from 1994. They include children in large families who are under a certain age (3 or 6 depending on family size), those receiving the minimum pension, invalids, veterans of the Great Patriotic War and other military operations, and those involved in the Chernobyl disaster. Entitlement extends to immediate family members. Since 2008, they can choose to receive free or subsidized medications or monetary benefits, under the "Supplementary Drug Provision" (DLO) program [5]. In practice, an increasing number of the 19 million potential beneficiaries choose the latter, so now less than 4 million people receive free drugs, for several reasons [6]. First, free and subsidized medicines are available only in certain pharmacies in specific medical institutions. Secondly, it is commonly believed that essential drugs are often unavailable in these pharmacies. Those choosing monetary compensation can thus obtain their medicines from private pharmacies, albeit at additional cost.

The aim of this study is to evaluate the availability and affordability of medicines used to treat cardiovascular diseases in six regions of the RF with different climatic, geographic, economic and demographic characteristics.

Material and methods

A list of 25 of the most commonly used cardiovascular medicines was compiled using several sources, including the "List of Essential Medicines" [7], the "Russian Register of Medicines" (https://grls.rosminzdrav.ru), and the "List of Vital and Essential Drugs for Medical Use for 2017" [8] and also rating of drugs published every month by independent companies [9] (Table 1).

The study to assess the availability and affordability of these medicines was conducted in 6 regions of the RF with different climatic, geographic, economic and demographic characteristics.
of the study, all participants underwent full-time and/or distance learning courses conducted by the staff from the National Medical Research Center for Preventive Medicine to standardize the collection of data into a specially developed Registration Form, and then data entry into the single database for analysis.

The study was conducted in pharmacies providing free medicines to welfare beneficiaries, as well as in licensed pharmacies serving all citizens who live on the territory of this subject of the RF. The cost of the medicines was assessed only in licensed pharmacies. The 14 pharmacies in various districts from each center were selected: 5 for beneficiaries and 5 of licensed. Recognizing that any pharmacy was vulnerable to transient logistic problems, whereby patients would look in a neighboring outlet, 2 substitutes were identified in each of the categories, to be visited should the initial one lack >50% of the medicines on the list.

The researchers were provided with documentation on the availability and price of the studied drugs on the day of the visit. Data in all regions was collected in August 2017. The data was collected on the second week of the month on Wednesday or Thursday. The drug was considered as «available» if it could be purchased or obtained by the researcher in the selected pharmacy on the day of the visit without prior order or waiting. In licensed pharmacies the price was recorded in rubles for one pack regardless to the number and dosage of tablets. All evaluated drugs were in a single dosage form – in the form of tablets. At the same time, the presence of the studied drug in a different dosage, according to the protocol, was the exclusion criterion. In each pharmacy, data was collected on both the original drug and the generic equivalent, at the same dose. Some medicines are, however, only available in the RF in one of these forms.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group of drugs / Группа препаратов</th>
<th>International non-proprietary name / Международное непатентованное наименование</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Diuretics / Диуретики</td>
<td>Furosemide, hydrochlorothiazide, indapamide, spironolactone</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Beta-blockers / Бета-адреноблокаторы</td>
<td>Bisoprol, atenolol, metoprolol (succinate), carvedilol, nebivolol</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACE inhibitors / Ингибиторы АПФ</td>
<td>Perindopril, enalapril, fosinopril, lisinopril</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Calcium channel blockers / Блокаторы кальциевых каналов</td>
<td>Amlodipine, nifedipine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Angiotensin II antagonists / Антагонисты ангиотензина II</td>
<td>Losartan, valsartan, olmesartan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Antiplatelet drugs / Антикагреганты</td>
<td>Clopidogrel, ticagrelor, acetylsalicilic acid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Statins / Статины</td>
<td>Atorvastatin, simvastatin, rosuvastatin, fluvastatin</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

ACE inhibitors – angiotensin-converting enzyme inhibitors
Ингибиторы АПФ – ингибиторы ангиотензинпревращающего фермента

Table 1. List of drugs most often prescribed for cardiovascular disease
Таблица 1. Список препаратов, наиболее часто назначаемых при сердечно-сосудистых заболеваниях

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group of drugs / Группа препаратов</th>
<th>International non-proprietary name / Международное непатентованное наименование</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ACE inhibitors – ингибиторы АПФ</td>
<td>Perindopril, enalapril, fosinopril, lisinopril</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Calcium channel blockers / Блокаторы кальциевых каналов</td>
<td>Amlodipine, nifedipine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Angiotensin II antagonists / Антагонисты ангиотензина II</td>
<td>Losartan, valsartan, olmesartan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Antiplatelet drugs / Антикагреганты</td>
<td>Clopidogrel, ticagrelor, acetylsalicilic acid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Statins / Статины</td>
<td>Atorvastatin, simvastatin, rosuvastatin, fluvastatin</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

ACE inhibitors – angiotensin-converting enzyme inhibitors
Ингибиторы АПФ – ингибиторы ангиотензинпревращающего фермента
It should be noted that, according to the changes in the Federal Law from December 22, 2014 N429-FZ "On Amendments to the Federal Law "On the Circulation of Medicines", from January 1, 2017 the concept «original medicinal drug» was replaced by the concept «reference drug», and the term "generic" was changed to “reproduced drug”. However, in this study we use the terms "original drug" and "generic" that are more familiar to the medical community.

Statistical analysis was carried out using the statistical analysis and information delivery package – STATA (Data Analysis and Statistical Software) 14 version. In this paper we report standard descriptive statistics. The monthly cost of treatment was calculated by multiplying the cost for one tablet on the number of tablets per day by 30 days per month.

Results
If a pharmacy supplying beneficiaries had a generic medicine, the original drug was not available.

There were no diuretics in a number of pharmacies for beneficiaries, in licensed pharmacies the presence of indapamide was highest (Table 2). Among beta-blockers – the greatest availability was for bisoprolol, whereas nebivolol was absent in a number of licensed pharmacies, not all pharmacies have carvedilol. Among the ACE inhibitors, enalapril in most of licensed pharmacies was represented by generics, lisinopril in a number of cities was represented by both the original medicine and generics. Fosinopril and perindopril were not available in a number of pharmacies for beneficiaries, but in the licensed pharmacies the availability was noticeably lower. The presence of sartans was markedly lower than of ACE inhibitors – olmesartan and valsartan were absent in a number of discount pharmacies. As for statins, the picture was not homogeneous – there was almost no fluvastatin (generic drugs do not exist), but atorvastatin and rosuvastatin were absent in a number of discount pharmacies. The greatest presence in this group was for simvastatin.

2 aptechных организаций, обслуживающие все категории граждан, в качестве резервных на случай, если в вы- бранной аптечной организации доступно менее 50% препаратов из анализируемого перечня.

Исследователям была предоставлена документация по наличию и цене изучаемых препаратов на день визита. Данные во всех регионах были собраны в августе 2017 г. Для унификации подхода информация собиралась во вторую неделю мес в среду или четверг. Лекарственный препарат считался «в наличии» в случае, если он мог быть приобретен или получен исследователем в отобранной аптечной организации в день посещения без предварительного заказа или ожидания. В графе «цена медикамента» (для коммерческих аптек) была указана его полная стоимость в рублях и копейках за упаковку, независимо от количества таблеток в ней. Все оцениваемые лекарственные средства были в единой лекарственной форме – виде таблеток. При этом наличие изучаемого препарата в другой дозировке, согласно протоколу, являлось критерием исключения. Были собраны данные об оригинальном препарате и о соответствующих «дженериках» в той же дозе, независимо от класса препарата или категории аптечки. Тем не менее, на территории РФ у нескольких препаратов отсутствует либо оригинальный препарат, или дженерик.

Следует отметить, что, согласно изменениям в Федеральном законе от 22 декабря 2014 г. №429-ФЗ «О внесении изменений в Федеральный закон «Об обращении лекарственных средств», с 1 января 2017 г. понятие «оригинального лекарственного препарата» было заменено на понятие «референтный лекарственный препарат», а термин «дженерик» изменен на «воспроизведенный лекарственный препарат». Тем не менее, в настоящем исследовании мы использовали более привычные медицинскому сообществу термины «оригинальный препарат» и «дженерик».

Статистический анализ результатов выполнен с помощью пакета статистического анализа и доставки информации – STATA (Data Analysis and Statistical Software) 14 версия. В данном исследовании использованы методы стандартной описательной статистики, в частности, вычисление средних, стандартных отклонений и стандартных ошибок, и ранговых статистик. Стоимость лечения лекарственным препаратом в мес рассчитывалась произведением стоимости одной таблетки в указанной дозе на количество таблеток в день, согласно рекомендациям по применению данного препарата, на среднее количество дней в мес.

Результаты
Анализ наличия препаратов показал общую закономерность – при существовании препарата-дженерика в льготной аптеке оригинальный препарат отсутствует.

Мочегонные препараты отсутствуют в ряде льготных аптеч, в коммерческих наиболее высоко присутствие ин-
It is important to note that in several pharmacies some medicines at the time of the study were available, but in a different dosage, which was the criterion for excluding this drug from the study.

When analyzing the cost of drugs in commercial pharmacies, it was found that drugs containing furosemide were the cheapest among generic drugs, treatment with these drugs per month is about 17 rubles (Table 3). Treatment with rosuvastatin generic drugs was the most expensive — about 4374 rubles.

### Table 2. The availability of drugs in preferential and commercial pharmacies of 6 regions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>INN / МНН</th>
<th>Dosage (mg)</th>
<th>Barnaul</th>
<th>Khabarovsk</th>
<th>Belgorod</th>
<th>Vologda</th>
<th>Kirov</th>
<th>Samara</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>B</td>
<td>L</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>L</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>L</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Diuretics / Диуретики</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Furosemide</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>1 4 4 5</td>
<td>0 2 5 5</td>
<td>0 0 5 5</td>
<td>0 5 5 5</td>
<td>0 0 5 5</td>
<td>0 0 5 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hydrochlorothiazide</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>4 0 4 1</td>
<td>0 0 4 3</td>
<td>0 4 5 0</td>
<td>0 0 5 0</td>
<td>0 0 5 0</td>
<td>0 0 5 0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indapamide</td>
<td>1,5</td>
<td>3 5 4 5</td>
<td>0 5 5 5</td>
<td>0 5 5 5</td>
<td>0 5 5 5</td>
<td>0 5 5 5</td>
<td>0 5 5 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spironolactone</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>2 0 5 3</td>
<td>0 5 4 2</td>
<td>0 0 5 1</td>
<td>0 0 5 0</td>
<td>0 0 5 0</td>
<td>0 0 5 0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Beta-blockers / Бета-адреноблокаторы</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bisoprolol</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>3 5 4 5</td>
<td>0 5 5 5</td>
<td>0 5 5 5</td>
<td>0 5 4 5</td>
<td>0 5 5 5</td>
<td>0 5 5 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Atenolol</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>2 - 5 -</td>
<td>0 - 5 -</td>
<td>0 - 5 -</td>
<td>0 - 5 -</td>
<td>0 - 5 -</td>
<td>0 - 5 -</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Metoprolol (succinate)</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>4 5 5 5</td>
<td>0 5 5 5</td>
<td>0 0 5 5</td>
<td>0 5 5 5</td>
<td>0 5 5 5</td>
<td>0 5 5 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carvedilol</td>
<td>12,5</td>
<td>1 3 4 5</td>
<td>0 1 0 5</td>
<td>0 0 5 0</td>
<td>0 5 0 4</td>
<td>0 2 0 5</td>
<td>0 1 5 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nebivolol</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2 5 5 5</td>
<td>0 0 5 4</td>
<td>0 4 5 5</td>
<td>0 0 4 4</td>
<td>0 0 4 2</td>
<td>0 0 5 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>ACE inhibitors / Ингибиторы АПФ</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perindopril</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3 4 4 5</td>
<td>0 5 5 2</td>
<td>0 5 5 2</td>
<td>0 5 5 2</td>
<td>0 5 5 2</td>
<td>0 5 5 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enalapril</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0 4 4 5</td>
<td>0 2 2 5</td>
<td>0 5 3 5</td>
<td>0 5 3 5</td>
<td>0 5 3 5</td>
<td>0 5 3 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fosinopril</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>1 2 4 5</td>
<td>0 0 1 3</td>
<td>0 0 5 3</td>
<td>0 5 2 4</td>
<td>0 0 3 4</td>
<td>0 0 5 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lisinopril</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>2 5 5 5</td>
<td>0 2 5 5</td>
<td>0 4 5 5</td>
<td>0 5 5 5</td>
<td>0 4 5 5</td>
<td>0 5 5 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Calcium channel blockers / Блокаторы кальциевых каналов</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amlodipine</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2 5 4 5</td>
<td>0 5 4 5</td>
<td>0 0 3 5</td>
<td>0 5 1 5</td>
<td>0 5 2 5</td>
<td>0 1 5 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nifedipine</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>- 1 - 4</td>
<td>- 4 - 4</td>
<td>- 0 - 2</td>
<td>- 0 - 2</td>
<td>- 0 - 2</td>
<td>- 0 - 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Angiotensin II antagonists / Антагонисты ангиотензина II</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Losartan</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>0 4 4 5</td>
<td>0 3 1 5</td>
<td>0 0 1 5</td>
<td>0 0 1 5</td>
<td>0 0 1 5</td>
<td>0 0 1 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Valsartan</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>1 1 4 5</td>
<td>0 3 4 0</td>
<td>0 1 1 5</td>
<td>0 0 1 5</td>
<td>0 0 1 5</td>
<td>0 0 1 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Olmesartan</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0 0 3 0</td>
<td>0 0 3 0</td>
<td>0 0 2 0</td>
<td>0 0 2 0</td>
<td>0 0 2 0</td>
<td>0 0 2 0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Antiplatelet medicines / Антиагреганты</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clopidogrel</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>1 4 4 5</td>
<td>0 5 5 5</td>
<td>0 5 5 5</td>
<td>0 5 3 5</td>
<td>0 5 3 5</td>
<td>0 5 3 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ticagrelor</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>2 - 3 -</td>
<td>0 - 3 -</td>
<td>0 - 2 -</td>
<td>0 - 1 -</td>
<td>0 - 1 -</td>
<td>0 - 1 -</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acetylsalicylic acid</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>- 5 - 5 -</td>
<td>- 3 - 5</td>
<td>- 1 - 5</td>
<td>- 5 - 5</td>
<td>- 5 - 5</td>
<td>- 5 - 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Statins / Статины</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Atorvastatin</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>1 5 4 5</td>
<td>0 5 4 5</td>
<td>0 0 4 0</td>
<td>0 5 0 5</td>
<td>0 2 2 5</td>
<td>0 3 5 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Simvastatin</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>0 5 2 5</td>
<td>0 5 1 5</td>
<td>0 5 0 3</td>
<td>0 5 0 3</td>
<td>0 5 0 3</td>
<td>0 5 0 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rosuvastatin</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>1 5 4 5</td>
<td>0 0 4 5</td>
<td>0 0 4 5</td>
<td>0 5 1 4</td>
<td>0 0 5 0</td>
<td>0 2 2 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fluvastatin</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>- 0 - 0</td>
<td>- 0 - 0</td>
<td>- 0 - 0</td>
<td>- 0 - 0</td>
<td>- 0 - 0</td>
<td>- 0 - 0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**INN** – International non-proprietary name; **B** – pharmacies for beneficiaries; **L** – licensed pharmacy; **O** – original drug, **G** – generics

**МНН** – международное непатентованное наименование, **Л** – льготная аптека, **К** – коммерческая, **О** – оригинальный препарат, **Д** – дженерик, «-» – не выпускается

It is important to note that in several pharmacies some medicines at the time of the study were available, but in a different dosage, which was the criterion for excluding this drug from the study.

When analyzing the cost of drugs in commercial pharmacies, it was found that drugs containing furosemide were the cheapest among generic drugs, treatment with these drugs per month is about 17 rubles (Table 3). Treatment with rosuvastatin generic drugs was the most expensive — about 4374 rubles.
for a month. The most expensive original drug was also rosuvastatin preparation – about 4500 rubles for 30 tablets, the cheapest – the original drug furosemide – about 35 rubles. The greatest difference in the cost of the original drug and generics was found in the group of preparations containing valsartan, which averaged 1500 rubles. Interestingly, the clopidogrel generic drugs can be bought both for 70 rubles, and for 3241 rubles (45 times more expensive), the same applies to rosuvastatin – the valsartan are absent in almost all the reimbursable pharmacies and strictly generics. Calcium channel blockers: if amlodipine is present in all commercial pharmacies as a minimum in the form of a generic, then nifedipine (original in some cases) in the corresponding dose is absent in 4 out of 5 reimbursable pharmacies of Belgorod, 3 out of 5 pharmacies of Khabarovsk.

Table 3. The cost of treatment with the original drug and a generic drug per month

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>INN / МНН</th>
<th>Dosage (mg)</th>
<th>The price of treatment with a drug per month (rubles)</th>
<th>Diuretics / Диуретики</th>
<th>Beta-blockers / Бета-адреноблокаторы</th>
<th>Calcium channel blockers / Блокаторы кальциевых каналов</th>
<th>Angiotensin II antagonists / Антагонисты ангиотензина II</th>
<th>Antiplatelet medicines / Антиагреганты</th>
<th>Statins / Статины</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Original / Оригинальный препарат</td>
<td>Generic / Дженирик</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Minimum Мінімум</td>
<td>Average Среднее</td>
<td>Maximum Максимум</td>
<td>Minimum Мінімум</td>
<td>Average Среднее</td>
<td>Maximum Максимум</td>
<td>Minimum Мінімум</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Furosemide</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>30.7</td>
<td>34.9</td>
<td>58.7</td>
<td>8.1</td>
<td>17.2</td>
<td>32.8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hydrochlorothiazide</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>64.2</td>
<td>83.5</td>
<td>96.4</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>41.5</td>
<td>50.5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indapamide</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>325</td>
<td>364</td>
<td>407.5</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>114.2</td>
<td>228</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spironolactone</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>162</td>
<td>365.4</td>
<td>422.6</td>
<td>136</td>
<td>295.2</td>
<td>392</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bisoprolol</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Atenolol</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>66.6</td>
<td>114</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Metoprolol (succinate)</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>159.6</td>
<td>560</td>
<td>681.6</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>157.8</td>
<td>636.4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carvedilol</td>
<td>12.5</td>
<td>1082.6</td>
<td>1109</td>
<td>1148</td>
<td>72.5</td>
<td>380</td>
<td>712</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nebivolol</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>921.4</td>
<td>1079.3</td>
<td>1285.7</td>
<td>123.2</td>
<td>470.7</td>
<td>1090.7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perindopril</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>167.2</td>
<td>476.4</td>
<td>604.6</td>
<td>106</td>
<td>238.3</td>
<td>285</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enalapril</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>327.8</td>
<td>716</td>
<td>16.7</td>
<td>177.3</td>
<td>353.1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fosinopril</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>450</td>
<td>514.1</td>
<td>583.9</td>
<td>220.7</td>
<td>361.5</td>
<td>583.9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lisinopril</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>257.1</td>
<td>608.9</td>
<td>690.9</td>
<td>42.6</td>
<td>242.9</td>
<td>825</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Losartan</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>162.5</td>
<td>264.2</td>
<td>323.8</td>
<td>45.5</td>
<td>140.5</td>
<td>262.5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Valsartan</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>1481.8</td>
<td>1700.8</td>
<td>2102.2</td>
<td>106.4</td>
<td>253.3</td>
<td>385.7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Olmesartan</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>516.4</td>
<td>572.1</td>
<td>691.6</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clopidogrel</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>2493.2</td>
<td>2971.8</td>
<td>3300</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>625</td>
<td>3241.7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ticagrelor</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>1446.4</td>
<td>2333.4</td>
<td>2814.7</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acetylsalicylic acid</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>73.1</td>
<td>151.9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Atorvastatin</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>1131.5</td>
<td>1930.5</td>
<td>2176</td>
<td>180</td>
<td>661.2</td>
<td>2198</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Simvastatin</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>1086</td>
<td>1348.1</td>
<td>1495.7</td>
<td>110.4</td>
<td>571.3</td>
<td>1138</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rosuvastatin</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>3163.9</td>
<td>3983.3</td>
<td>4456.1</td>
<td>213</td>
<td>756.7</td>
<td>4374.9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fluvastatin</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>1685.1</td>
<td>1963.2</td>
<td>2102.2</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

INN – International non-proprietary name
МНН – международное непатентованное наименование
minimum price of which is 213 rubles, and the maximum is 20 times more expensive. As for the original drugs, the maximum difference in the price was observed for ticagrelor – 1400 rubles.

On average, the cost of CVD treatment for the main classes of drugs, including ACE inhibitor, beta-blocker, antiplatelet agent and statin, was 1921.9 rubles per month (Fig. 1). And, if the drugs were original, then the average price increased to 5902.2 rubles, and in case of buying only generics – dropped to 1299.4 rubles. Interesting, that the minimum price of drugs from 4 groups in the complex was 142 rubles. The most expensive purchase of these drugs was in Vologda, the cheapest – in Kirov. In this case, if one bought all the original drugs in Vologda, then their cost on average would be about 8700 rubles, while generics would cost 5.8 times cheaper. In Kirov, the original drugs in the complex would cost as much as 2834 rubles, and generics – 3772 rubles. It was interesting that if the highest cost of the original drugs was noted in Vologda, then for generics – in Khabarovsk. At the same time, the minimum price of generics was also in Khabarovsk.

**Discussion**

The Russian government has identified access to affordable medicines as a major priority for its healthcare reforms. For this goal the Federal Supplementary Drug Provision (DLO) program, designed to provide free or subsidized drugs from the regularly updated List of Medicines for certain categories of citizens eligible for state aid, has

![Chart](image_url)

**Рисунок 1. Расчет средней стоимости лечения в месяц основными классами препаратов (ингибитор АПФ+бета-адреноблокатор+антиагрегант+статин)**

**Figure 1. Calculation of the average cost of monthly treatment with the main classes of drugs (ACE inhibitor+beta-blocker+antiplatelet medicine+statin)**
been developed [11]. However, some of those who are eligible for these provisions have opted to take the benefits in money instead in accordance with the Federal Law No.122-FZ. They can then use the funds provided to purchase drugs in licensed pharmacies.

The content analysis of media publications conducted by the specialists of the Financial University showed that the lack of medicines in pharmacies are perceived by the people as the most frequent problem related to the health system (31%), followed by increasing prices of drugs (25.5%), refusals by physicians to prescribe the requested medicines to patients (15%) and suggestions of doctors to a patient to purchase a particular medicine at his or her own expense (13.7%) [12]. I.K. Petrukhin and V.A. Kurkin, analyzing the program of preferential drug provision in the Volga Federal District, noted significant regional differences in funding for a single recipient [13].

In this study, the availability of drugs for the treatment of CVD was analyzed in all participating regions. It draws attention that in pharmacies for beneficiaries there were mainly generic drugs. There was also some regional variability in the availability of drugs at the time of the study – for example, the ACE inhibitor fosinopril was completely absent in the pharmacies for beneficiaries of Belgorod and Khabarovsk, and among the licensed pharmacies it was available only in Belgorod – in each of five (both original and generic), in Khabarovsk only in one pharmacy there was the original drug, in three out of five – generics.

It should be noted that in addition to the availability of drugs in the pharmacy, we assessed their affordability, i.e. the cost. In this regard, all the analyzed drugs were in the same dosage for each item, which was chosen based on the recommendations on the use of the drug and in accordance with the "List of Vital and Essential Drugs for Medical Use for 2017" [8]. At the same time, in some cases, at the time of the study, appropriate preparations were available in the pharmacy at other dosages, which, according to the protocol, were not included in the analysis. It should also be noted that the evaluation of the fixed combinations of drugs widely used in the treatment of CVD was not the objective of this study.

In the analysis of affordability, it was found that almost all drugs are represented both in licensed pharmacies and pharmacies for beneficiaries, except for pharmacies for beneficiaries in Belgorod, where at the time of the study there were no calcium channel blockers, and in Vologda, where also there were no antagonists of angiotensin II receptors in phar-
macies for beneficiaries. Probably, this is because at present the pharmaceutical industry offers a wide range of drugs to the pharmacy visitor, including several types of generics for each original drug, for the treatment of CVD. In addition, the possibility of replacing drugs in our country is regulated by Government Decree of October 28, 2015 No. 1154 "On the procedure for determining the interchangeability of medicinal products for medical use." On the Russian pharmaceutical market there is a generally wide variety of generics, the main differences being the manufacturer and the country where the drug was released. Thus, our country ranks third in the share of reproduced drugs in the world after China and India, far exceeding Japan, Germany and the USA [8]. To date, according to research conducted by economists, the choice of the Russian consumer on the pharmaceutical market determines the effectiveness and safety of the drug and its price, unstable under inflation and devaluation of the ruble [6]. I.M. Burykin et al. also showed wide fluctuations in the cost of therapy of one patient with arterial hypertension in the Republic of Tatarstan – from 542.72±98.87 rubles up to 4870.80±1071.93, on the average – 1806.26±416.53 in the prices of 2008 [14]. Similar data were obtained in our study, a wide range of prices not only between the original drug and the generic, but also between the two generics. Often, the price of one generic is several times lower than its analogue. The study conducted in the Republic of Tatarstan on the methodology of WHO (2011-2013) using the example of a pharmacy network, analyzed the consumption of drugs for the treatment of CVD. The authors showed a relationship between the spectrum of drugs sold and the availability of medical facilities nearby. In addition, a volume analysis was carried out for individual groups of drugs (per 1,000 people) – enalapril was the first among the ACE inhibitors, atenolol among the selective beta-blockers, furosemide among the diuretics, among the sartans – losartan (generic Lozap), and in 2012 – losartan (generic Lorista). Among the statins, the authors noted a decrease in the share of simvastatin from 44.8% in 2011 to 15.9% in 2013, while sales of atorvastatin, on the contrary, increased from 9.1% to 29.1% [15].

The study PURE analyzed the availability and affordability (cost) of drugs for the treatment of CVD (Aspirin, beta-blockers, ACE inhibitors and statins) in connection with the level of economic development of the country. The authors noted a positive relationship between the availability of preparations of all 4 groups analyzed and the level of economic development of the country. The affordability of drugs torysty кальциевых каналов, и Вологды, где также в льготных аптеках не было антагонистов рецепторов ангиотензина II. Вероятно, это связано с тем, что в настоящее время фармацевтическая промышленность предлагает посетителю аптечки широкий спектр препаратов для лечения сердечно-сосудистых заболеваний, в том числе, несколько видов дженериков к каждому оригинальному препарату. К тому же, возможность замены препаратов в нашей стране регулируется Постановлением Правительства РФ от 28 октября 2015 г. №1154 «О порядке определения взаимозаменяемости лекарственных препаратов для медицинского применения». На российском фармацевтическом рынке отмечается в целом большое разнообразие дженериков, основными отличиями которых является фирма-производитель и страна, где был препарат выпущен. Так, наша страна занимает третье место по доле сегмента воспроизведенных препаратов в мире после Китая и Индии, на много превосходя Японию, Германию и США [8]. По данным проведенных экономистами исследований на сегодняшний день выбор российского потребителя на рынке фармацевтической продукции определяет эффективность и безопасность препарата, и его цена, нестабильная в условиях инфляции и девальвации рубля [6]. И.М. Буркин и соавт. также показали широкие колебания стоимости терапии одного больного артериальной гипертонией в республике Татарстан – от 542,72±98,87 руб до 4870,80±1071,93 руб, в среднем же – 1806,26±416,53 руб в ценах 2008 г [14]. Аналогичные данные были получены и в нашем исследовании, большой разброс цен не только между оригинальным препаратом и дженериком, но и между двумя дженериками: зачастую цена одного дженерика была в несколько раз ниже его аналога. Исследование, проведенное в Республике Татарстан по методологии ВОЗ (2011-2013) на примере одной аптечной сети изучало потребление препаратов для лечения ССЗ. Авторы показали связь между спектром продаваемых препаратов и наличием лечебно-профилактических учреждений по близости. Кроме того, был проведен анализ объема по отдельным группам препаратов (на 1000 чел.) – среди ингибиторов АПФ на первом месте – эналаприл, среди селективных бета-адреноблокаторов – атенолол, среди диуретиков – фуросемид, среди статинов – лозартан (дженерик Лориста). Среди статинов авторы отметили снижение доли симвастатина с 44,8% в 2011 г. до 15,9% в 2013 г., тогда как продажи аторвалстатина, напротив, выросли с 9,1% до 29,1%) [15].

В рамках исследования PURE был проведен анализ наличия и доступности (стоимости) препаратов для лечения ССЗ (аспирин, бета-адреноблокаторы, ингибиторы АПФ и статинов) в связи с уровнем экономического развития страны. Авторы отметили положительную связь наличия препаратов всех 4 анализируемых групп и уровня экономического развития страны. Доступность препаратов также
is also closely linked with the level of development of the country — in high-income countries the cost of drugs ~ 1% of household income, and in low-income countries — from 17% in cities to 49% in rural areas. The data obtained in India stand out — in this country with a low level of economic development thanks to the dynamic growth of the pharmaceutical industry, including producing generic drugs, the availability and affordability of drugs is very different from countries with the same level of the economy [4]. According to the results of our study, it was found that the minimum price of a complex of 4 groups of drugs for the treatment of CVD is 156 rubles, while the average price is about 2 thousand rubles. The data obtained on the one hand undoubtedly testify to the affordability of at least basic classes of drugs for the treatment of CVD. On the other hand, the difference in cost, sometimes very weighty, raises the problem of assessing the effectiveness of the drugs compared. The objectives of this study were not to evaluate the bioequivalence of drugs, but significant differences in the cost of a set of drugs recommended for the treatment of a single disease indicate the need for further study of the problem from this point of view. In their works on the study of the comparative effectiveness of original and reproduced drugs, S.Yu. Martsevich and S.N. Tolpygina raised the need for a wider coverage of the results of such comparisons [16], but the results of such works are more intended for the medical community, whereas the patient in the pharmacy is often forced to make a choice independently or following the advice of the pharmacist without having this information.

Conclusion

Thus, the basic cardiovascular medicines were characterized by a relatively high accessibility in the six regions of the RF included in the analysis both by the criterion of the availability of drugs, and by the criterion of the minimum price.

Disclosures. This study was funded by the Wellcome Trust, as part of the International Project on Cardiovascular Disease in Russia (IPCDR) [100217]; Ministry of Health and Care Services of Norway; Norwegian Institute of Public Health and UiT (Arctic University of Norway). Sponsors had no influence on the study design, data collection and analysis, the decision to prepare the article for publication and its publication.
References / Literature


About the Authors:

Asiya E. Imaeva – MD, PhD, Senior Researcher, Department of Epidemiology of Chronic Non-Communicable Diseases, National Medical Research Center for Preventive Medicine

Yulia A. Balanova – MD, PhD, Leading Researcher, Laboratory of Economic Analysis of Epidemiological Researches and Preventive Technologies, Department of Epidemiology of Chronic Non-Communicable Diseases, National Medical Research Center for Preventive Medicine

Anna V. Kontsevay – MD, PhD, MSc (LSE), Deputy Director on Science and Technology, National Medical Research Center for Preventive Medicine

Anna V. Kapustina – MD, PhD, Senior Researcher, Department of Epidemiology of Chronic Non-Communicable Diseases, National Medical Research Center for Preventive Medicine

Dmitry V. Duplyakov – MD, PhD, Professor, Medical Director, Samara Regional Cardiology Clinic

Olga H. Malysheva – Head of Medical Information-Analytical Centre (Kirov)

Irina V. Osipova – MD, PhD, Professor, Head of Faculty Therapy Chair, Altai State Medical University

Tatiana A. Petrichko – MD, PhD, Head of Therapy and Preventive Medicine, Postgraduate Institute for Public Health Workers (Khabarovsk)

Georgiy I. Kroponin – MD, Chief Doctor, Regional Center for Medical Prevention (Belgorod)

Riza A. Kasimov – PhD (Pedagogics), Director, Vologda Regional Center of Medical Prevention Care

David A. Leon – PhD, Professor of Epidemiology, Department of Non-communicable Disease Epidemiology, Faculty of Epidemiology and Population Health, London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine; Department of Community Medicine, Faculty of Health Sciences, The University of Tromsø – The Arctic University of Norway

Martin McKee – DSc, Department of Health Services Research and Policy, London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine

Sведения об авторах:

Имаева Ася Эмировна – к.м.н., с.н.с., отдел эпидемиологии хронических неинфекционных заболеваний, НМИЦ ПМ

Баланова Юлия Андреевна – к.м.н., в.н.с., лаборатория экономического анализа эпидемиологических исследований и профилактических технологий, отдел эпидемиологии хронических неинфекционных заболеваний, НМИЦ ПМ

Концевая Анна Васильевна – д.м.н., зам. директора по научно-аналитической работе, НМИЦ ПМ

Капустина Анна Владимировна – к.м.н., с.н.с., отдел эпидемиологии хронических неинфекционных заболеваний, НМИЦ ПМ

Дупляков Дмитрий Викторович – д.м.н., профессор, зам. главного врача по медицинской части, Саамарский областной клинический кардиологический диспансер

Мальшева Ольга Герольдовна – руководитель Медицинского информационно-аналитического центра

Осипова Ирина Владимировна – д.м.н., профессор, зав. кафедрой факультетской терапии, Алтайский государственный медицинский университет

Петричко Татьяна Алексеевна – д.м.н., зав. кафедрой терапии и профилактической медицины, Институт повышения квалификации специалистов здравоохранения (Хабаровск)

Крапошины Георгий Иванович – главный врач, Областная центр медицинской профилактики (Белгород)

Касимов Риза Ахмедзакиевич – д.м.н., директор Вологодского областного центра медицинской профилактики

Леон Дэвид – PhD, профессор эпидемиологии, отдел эпидемиологии неинфекционных заболеваний, факультет эпидемиологии и общественного здоровья, Лондонская школа гигиены и труда (London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine); отдел общественной медицины, факультет медицинских наук, Университет Тромсё – Арктический университет Норвегии

Макци Мартин – профессор европейского общественного здоровья, отдел исследований и политик здравоохранения, Лондонская школа гигиены и труда медицинской профилактики

Rational Pharmacotherapy in Cardiology 2018;14(6) / Рациональная Фармакотерапия в Кардиологии 2018;14(6)