# Figures and tables

**Box 1: Domains of integration**, drawing on (Shigayeva and Coker, 2015, Groene and Garcia-Barbero, 2001, Briggs and Garner, 2006, Atun et al., 2010b, WHO, 2008, Atun et al., 2010a)

|  |
| --- |
| * + Integration across disease programmes (clinically related diseases)
	+ Integration across disease programmes (clinically different diseases), for example:
		- Integration across high burden conditions (e.g. HIV, malaria, TB) to reduce impact of co-infections
	+ Integration between vertical (disease-specific) and horizontal (system-wide) programmes, which may involve:
		- Integration of interventions within a ‘building block’ of the health system (e.g. integrated staff training, financial and organisational management etc.)
		- Integration across one or more building blocks of the health system (e.g. human resource policies and governance initiatives)
		- Integration across ‘service functions’: of inputs, of different levels of service delivery, of management and operational decisions and technology
	+ Integration across public health programmes and health service interventions, for example:
		- integration between MNCH, family planning, through trained community health workers, and health promotion.
	+ Integration across activities in the health systems and other sectors (e.g. treatment combined with educational interventions and community mobilisation)
 |

**Figure 1: Health systems ‘building block’ framework**



Source: **(WHO, 2007)**

**Figure 2. Study flow diagram**

**Included**

**Eligibility**

**Screening**

**Identification**

**11,057** Records identified through data base searching

Number of duplicates removed 3,441

7,616 Records screened by title and abstract

Records excluded

 (n=7,276)

Full-text articles assessed for eligibility

(n=340)

Studies included in the review (n=**153, in 150 papers**)

Full-text articles excluded (n=185)

**Table 1: Cross-cutting themes: “+” = facilitator, “-“ = barrier**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Cross-cutting theme | Subtheme | +/- | Generalisability | Illustrative references | Recommendations |
| **Collaboration/ coordination/ relationships/ links** | Strong relationships between providers and stakeholders  | +- | Strong: range of settings and programmes | (Dodds et al., 2004, Odafe et al., 2013, UNAIDS, 2011) | Programme design and staffing should allow sufficient opportunity to build formal and informal linkages and ensure patients well informed: named coordinators may be beneficial in certain circumstances and for complex needs  |
|  | Strong links, communication and collaboration between providers.  | +- | Strong: range of settings and programmes | (Andersen et al., 2003, Bouis et al., 2007, Feingold and Slammon, 1993) |
|  | Coordination and case management of individual’s care – including coordination/navigation of care by an identified person (coordinator/advocate/nurse practitioner) | +- | Moderate: Particularly for complex needs around mental health or substance abuse, high income settings | (Feingold and Slammon, 1993, Finkelstein et al., 2011) |
|  | Information sharing between staff/providers – including regulatory barriers to info sharing  | +- | Moderate: several papers,  | (Lombard et al., 2009, Inouye et al., 2011, Mwanahamuntu et al., 2011) |
|  | Information for patients (including accounting for cultural issues)  | +- | Strong: range of settings and programmes | (Odafe et al., 2013, Khozaim et al., 2014, Ibrahim et al., 2009) |
| **Health workers: trained, available, multidisciplinary, motivated, incentivised** | Availability of human resources including specialist staff | +- | Strong: range of settings and programmes | (Egan et al., 2011, Edwards et al., 2015, Kumakech et al., 2015, Wood, 2008), | Resourcing should ensure adequate staff from the necessary disciplines, plus training and support as appropriate |
|  | Staff education, training, expertise, skills and experience including ongoing support, supervision and training | +- | Strong: range of settings and programmes | (Altice et al., 2004, Anderson et al., 2015, Hasin et al., 2013, Horo et al., 2012, Huchko et al., 2011, Ibrahim et al., 2009, Khozaim et al., 2014, Kieran et al., 2011, Martin et al., 2014, Moon et al., 2012, Nyabera et al., 2011, Odafe et al., 2013, Ramogola-Masire et al., 2012, Clanon et al., 2005, Kotwani et al., 2014) |
|  | Multidisciplinary teams  | + | Strong: range of settings and programmes  | (Edwards et al., 2015, Kumakech et al., 2015, Wood, 2008) |
|  | Staff culture, interest, awareness, enthusiasm – ie whether or not the staff are motivated and want to engage  | +- | Moderate: several papers, mostly US Substance Abuse | (Cheever et al., 2011, Curran et al., 2011) |
|  | Financial incentives to take part (adopt models and training)  | + | Weak: very limited number of papers | (Mwanahamuntu et al., 2011, Turner et al., 2005, Rothman et al., 2007) |
| **Institutional structures and infrastructure including financial resources and medical supplies** | Location, setting (this includes both accessibility and appropriateness)  | +- | Strong: range of settings and programmes | (Rothman et al., 2007, Kumakech et al., 2015, Dillard et al., 2010) | Careful consideration should be given to location(s), according to patient needs and circumstances |
|  | funding to set up and sustain services  | +- | Moderate: range of settings and programmes but limited number of papers | (Jonsson et al., 2011, Moon et al., 2012, Stringari-Murray et al., 2003, Hennessy et al., 2007, McCarthy et al., 1992) |
|  | Financing arrangements enabling access to (rather than being a barrier to) integrated services – according to country context e.g. insurance, free care | +- | Moderate: range of programmes mainly but not exclusively US, | (Bouis et al., 2007, Finkelstein et al., 2011, Stringari-Murray et al., 2003) |
|  | Drug supply and availability; equipment  | +- | Moderate: several papers, range of settings | (Cheever et al., 2011, Finkelstein et al., 2011, Grenfell et al., 2012) |
| **Leadership/ stewardship/ Procedures / organisational culture** | Leadership, Lesson-learning and scale up, commitment and buy in from senior leaders , Buy in / acceptance of model and treatment from front line managers and staff, Resistance to change - presence or lack | +- | Strong: range of settings and programmes | (Hoffman et al., 2004, Moon et al., 2012, UNAIDS, 2011, Mwanahamuntu et al., 2011) | An important precondition for implementing integration is the presence of high level commitment from the start, effective management structures and processes that are able to adapt and buy-in from front line users. Promoting change of organisational culture through dialogue, training, relationship building and appropriate use of knowledge and protocols will be important.Constant adaptation and lesson learning is essential to ensure that integration policy is fit for purpose.(this can be through monitoring and evaluation, reflection or other tools for systems (rather than programme) assessment) |
|  | Structural & programme design facilitators & barriers: In/flexibility, availability, algorithms, checklists, Tools, guidelines and protocols including for referral and follow up;treatment regimen (simple vs complex);  | +- | Moderate: several papers, range of settings  | (Curran et al., 2011, Rothman et al., 2007, Adeyemi et al., 2009, Clanon et al., 2005, Edwards et al., 2015, Goodroad et al., 2010, Kobayashi and Standridge, 2000, Kumakech et al., 2015, Odafe et al., 2013, UNAIDS, 2011, Adams et al., 2011) |
|  | Techniques & procedures/treatment (having or not having access to appropriate, timely, techniques) | +- | Strong: range of programmes and settings | (Turner et al., 2005, Tran et al., 2012) |
|  | Different organisational culture (e.g. “behavioural vs medical”) | - | Weak: limited number of studies, mainly from USA in regards to mental health or substance misuse | (Cheever et al., 2011) |

ADAMS, J., POLLARD, R. S. & SIKKEMA, K. J. 2011. Feasibility of integrated depression care in an HIV clinic. *Psychiatr Serv,* 62**,** 804.

ADEYEMI, O., VIBHAKAR, S. & MAX, B. 2009. Are we meeting the American Diabetes Association goals for HIV-infected patients with diabetes mellitus? *Clin Infect Dis,* 49**,** 799-802.

ALTICE, F. L., MEZGER, J. A., HODGES, J., BRUCE, R. D., MARINOVICH, A., WALTON, M., SPRINGER, S. A. & FRIEDLAND, G. H. 2004. Developing a directly administered antiretroviral therapy intervention for HIV-infected drug users: implications for program replication. *Clin Infect Dis,* 38 Suppl 5**,** S376-87.

ANDERSEN, M., PALIWODA, J., KACZYNSKI, R., SCHOENER, E., HARRIS, C., MADEJA, C., REID, H., WEBER, C. & TRENT, C. 2003. Integrating medical and substance abuse treatment for addicts living with HIV/AIDS: evidence-based nursing practice model. *Am J Drug Alcohol Abuse,* 29**,** 847-59.

ANDERSON, J., WYSONG, M., ESTEP, D., BESANA, G., KIBWANA, S., VARALLO, J., SUN, K. & LU, E. 2015. Evaluation of Cervical Cancer Screening Programs in Cote d'Ivoire, Guyana, and Tanzania: Effect of HIV Status. *PLoS One,* 10**,** e0139242.

ATUN, R., DE JONGH, T. & SECCI, F. 2010a. A systematic review of the evidence on integration of targeted health interventions into health systems. *Health Policy and Planning,* 25**,** 1-14.

ATUN, R., DE JONGH, T., SECCI, F., OHIRI, K. & ADEYI, O. 2010b. Integration of targeted health interventions into health systems: a conceptual framework for analysis. *Health Policy and Planning,* 25**,** 104-111.

BOUIS, S., REIF, S., WHETTEN, K., SCOVIL, J., MURRAY, A. & SWARTZ, M. 2007. An integrated, multidimensional treatment model for individuals living with HIV, mental illness, and substance abuse. *Health Soc Work,* 32**,** 268-78.

BRIGGS, C. & GARNER, P. 2006. Strategies for integrating primary health services in middle- and low-income countries at the point of delivery. *Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews,* 2**,** CD003318.

CHEEVER, L. W., KRESINA, T. F., CAJINA, A. & LUBRAN, R. 2011. A model federal collaborative to increase patient access to buprenorphine treatment in HIV primary care. *J Acquir Immune Defic Syndr,* 56 Suppl 1**,** S3-6.

CLANON, K. A., JOHANNES MUELLER, J. & HARANK, M. 2005. Integrating treatment for hepatitis C virus infection into an HIV clinic. *Clin Infect Dis,* 40 Suppl 5**,** S362-6.

CURRAN, G. M., PYNE, J., FORTNEY, J. C., GIFFORD, A., ASCH, S. M., RIMLAND, D., RODRIGUEZ-BARRADAS, M., MONSON, T. P., KILBOURNE, A. M., HAGEDORN, H. & ATKINSON, J. H. 2011. Development and implementation of collaborative care for depression in HIV clinics. *AIDS Care,* 23**,** 1626-36.

DILLARD, D., BINCSIK, A. K., ZEBLEY, C., MONGARE, K., HARRISON, J., GERARDI, K. E. & PARCHER, D. W. 2010. Integrated nested services: Delaware's experience treating minority substance abusers at risk for HIV or HIV positive. *J Evid Based Soc Work,* 7**,** 130-43.

DODDS, S., NUEHRING, E. M., BLANEY, N. T., BLAKLEY, T., LIZZOTTE, J. M., LOPEZ, M., POTTER, J. E. & O'SULLIVAN, M. J. 2004. Integrating mental health services into primary HIV care for women: the Whole Life project. *Public Health Rep,* 119**,** 48-59.

EDWARDS, J. K., BYGRAVE, H., VAN DEN BERGH, R., KIZITO, W., CHETI, E., KOSGEI, R. J., SOBRY, A., VANDENBULCKE, A., VAKIL, S. N. & REID, T. 2015. HIV with non-communicable diseases in primary care in Kibera, Nairobi, Kenya: Characteristics and outcomes 2010-2013. *Transactions of the Royal Society of Tropical Medicine and Hygiene,* 109**,** 440-446.

EGAN, J. E., NETHERLAND, J., GASS, J., FINKELSTEIN, R., WEISS, L. & COLLABORATIVE, B. 2011. Patient perspectives on buprenorphine/naloxone treatment in the context of HIV care. *J Acquir Immune Defic Syndr,* 56 Suppl 1**,** S46-53.

FEINGOLD, A. & SLAMMON, W. R. 1993. A model integrating mental health and primary care services for families with HIV. *Gen Hosp Psychiatry,* 15**,** 290-300.

FINKELSTEIN, R., NETHERLAND, J., SYLLA, L., GOUREVITCH, M. N., CAJINA, A., CHEEVER, L. & COLLABORATIVE, B. 2011. Policy implications of integrating buprenorphine/naloxone treatment and HIV care. *J Acquir Immune Defic Syndr,* 56 Suppl 1**,** S98-S104.

GOODROAD, B. K., WRIGHT, T. & RHAME, F. S. 2010. Integrating HIV-related evidence-based renal care guidelines into adult HIV clinics. *J Assoc Nurses AIDS Care,* 21**,** 113-24.

GRENFELL, P., RHODES, T., CARVALHO, A. C., MARTINS, A., COSME, D. & BARROS, H. 2012. A rapid assessment of the accessibility and integration of HIV, TB and harm reduction services for people who inject drugs in Portugal. Copenhagen: WHO Regional Office for Europe.

GROENE, O. & GARCIA-BARBERO, M. 2001. Integrated care: a position paper of the WHO European office for integrated health care services. *International Journal of Integrated Care,* 1**,** 1-10.

HASIN, D. S., AHARONOVICH, E., O'LEARY, A., GREENSTEIN, E., PAVLICOVA, M., ARUNAJADAI, S., WAXMAN, R., WAINBERG, M., HELZER, J. & JOHNSTON, B. 2013. Reducing heavy drinking in HIV primary care: a randomized trial of brief intervention, with and without technological enhancement. *Addiction (Abingdon, England),* 108**,** 1230-40.

HENNESSY, R. R., WEISFUSE, I. B. & SCHLANGER, K. 2007. Does integrating viral hepatitis services into a public STD clinic attract injection drug users for care? *Public Health Rep,* 122 Suppl 2**,** 31-5.

HOFFMAN, H. L., CASTRO-DONLAN, C. A., JOHNSON, V. M. & CHURCH, D. R. 2004. The Massachusetts HIV, hepatitis, addiction services integration (HHASI) experience: responding to the comprehensive needs of individuals with co-occurring risks and conditions. *Public Health Rep,* 119**,** 25-31.

HORO, A., JAQUET, A., EKOUEVI, D. K., TOURE, B., COFFIE, P. A., EFFI, B., MESSOU, E., MINGA, A., MOH, R., KONE, M., DABIS, F., SASCO, A. J. & IE, D. E. A. W. A. C. 2012. Cervical cancer screening by visual inspection in Cote d'Ivoire, operational and clinical aspects according to HIV status. *BMC Public Health,* 12**,** 237.

HUCHKO, M. J., BUKUSI, E. A. & COHEN, C. R. 2011. Building capacity for cervical cancer screening in outpatient HIV clinics in the Nyanza province of western Kenya. *Int J Gynaecol Obstet,* 114**,** 106-10.

IBRAHIM, F. W., SCHEMBRI, G., TAHA, H., ARIYANAYAGAM, S. & DHAR, J. 2009. Cervical surveillance in HIV-positive women: a genitourinary medicine clinic experience. *J Fam Plann Reprod Health Care,* 35**,** 101-3.

INOUYE, J., BOLAND, M. G., NIGG, C. R., SULLIVAN, K., LEAKE, A., MARK, D. & ALBRIGHT, C. L. 2011. A center for self-management of chronic illnesses in diverse groups. *Hawaii Med J,* 70**,** 4-8.

JONSSON, G., FURIN, J., JEENAH, F., MOOSA, M. Y., SIVEPERSAD, R., KALAFATIS, F. & SCHOEMAN, J. 2011. Human rights, mental illness, and HIV: the Luthando Neropsychiatric HIV Clinic in Soweto, South Africa. *Health Hum Rights,* 13**,** E64-72.

KHOZAIM, K., ORANG'O, E., CHRISTOFFERSEN-DEB, A., ITSURA, P., OGUDA, J., MULIRO, H., NDIEMA, J., MWANGI, G., STROTHER, M., CU-UVIN, S., ROSEN, B. & WASHINGTON, S. 2014. Successes and challenges of establishing a cervical cancer screening and treatment program in western Kenya. *Int J Gynaecol Obstet,* 124**,** 12-8.

KIERAN, J., DILLON, A., FARRELL, G., JACKSON, A., NORRIS, S., MULCAHY, F. & BERGIN, C. 2011. High uptake of hepatitis C virus treatment in HIV/hepatitis C virus co-infected patients attending an integrated HIV/hepatitis C virus clinic. *Int J STD AIDS,* 22**,** 571-6.

KOBAYASHI, J. S. & STANDRIDGE, W. L. 2000. An integrated program for comprehensive HIV care. *New Dir Ment Health Serv***,** 111-8.

KOTWANI, P., BALZER, L., KWARISIIMA, D., CLARK, T. D., KABAMI, J., BYONANEBYE, D., BAINOMUJUNI, B., BLACK, D., CHAMIE, G., JAIN, V., THIRUMURTHY, H., KAMYA, M. R., GENG, E. H., PETERSEN, M. L., HAVLIR, D. V., CHARLEBOIS, E. D. & COLLABORATION, S. 2014. Evaluating linkage to care for hypertension after community-based screening in rural Uganda. *Trop Med Int Health,* 19**,** 459-68.

KUMAKECH, E., ANDERSSON, S., WABINGA, H. & BERGGREN, V. 2015. Integration of HIV and cervical cancer screening perceptions and preferences of communities in Uganda. *BMC Women's Health,* 15.

LOMBARD, F., PROESCHOLDBELL, R. J., COOPER, K., MUSSELWHITE, L. & QUINLIVAN, E. B. 2009. Adaptations across clinical sites of an integrated treatment model for persons with HIV and substance abuse. *AIDS Patient Care STDS,* 23**,** 631-8.

MARTIN, C. E., TERGAS, A. I., WYSONG, M., REINSEL, M., ESTEP, D. & VARALLO, J. 2014. Evaluation of a single-visit approach to cervical cancer screening and treatment in Guyana: feasibility, effectiveness and lessons learned. *J Obstet Gynaecol Res,* 40**,** 1707-16.

MCCARTHY, G. A., COCKELL, A. P., KELL, P. D., BEEVOR, A. S. & BOAG, F. C. 1992. A women-only clinic for HIV, genitourinary medicine and substance misuse. *Genitourin Med,* 68**,** 386-9.

MOON, T. D., SILVA-MATOS, C., CORDOSO, A., BAPTISTA, A. J., SIDAT, M. & VERMUND, S. H. 2012. Implementation of cervical cancer screening using visual inspection with acetic acid in rural Mozambique: successes and challenges using HIV care and treatment programme investments in Zambezia Province. *J Int AIDS Soc,* 15**,** 17406.

MWANAHAMUNTU, M. H., SAHASRABUDDHE, V. V., KAPAMBWE, S., PFAENDLER, K. S., CHIBWESHA, C., MKUMBA, G., MUDENDA, V., HICKS, M. L., VERMUND, S. H., STRINGER, J. S. & PARHAM, G. P. 2011. Advancing cervical cancer prevention initiatives in resource-constrained settings: insights from the Cervical Cancer Prevention Program in Zambia. *PLoS Med,* 8**,** e1001032.

NYABERA, R., YONGA, G., MWANGEMI, F. & BUKACHI, F. 2011. Evaluation of a project integrating cardiovascular care into HIV programmes. *Cardiovascular Journal of Africa*

ODAFE, S., TORPEY, K., KHAMOFU, H., OLADELE, E., ADEDOKUN, O., CHABIKULI, O., MUKADDAS, H., USMAN, Y., AIYENIGBA, B. & OKOYE, M. 2013. *Integrating cervical cancer screening with HIV care in a district hospital in Abuja, Nigeria* [Online]. India. Available: <http://www.nigeriamedj.com/article.asp?issn=0300-1652;year=2013;volume=54;issue=3;spage=176;epage=184;aulast=Odafe> [Accessed Department of Prevention, Care and Treatment, FHI 360, Garki, Nigeria. 54].

RAMOGOLA-MASIRE, D., DE KLERK, R., MONARE, B., RATSHAA, B., FRIEDMAN, H. M. & ZETOLA, N. M. 2012. Cervical cancer prevention in HIV-infected women using the "see and treat" approach in Botswana. *J Acquir Immune Defic Syndr,* 59**,** 308-13.

ROTHMAN, J., RUDNICK, D., SLIFER, M., AGINS, B., HEINER, K. & BIRKHEAD, G. 2007. Co-located substance use treatment and HIV prevention and primary care services, New York State, 1990-2002: a model for effective service delivery to a high-risk population. *J Urban Health,* 84**,** 226-42.

SHIGAYEVA, A. & COKER, R. J. 2015. Communicable disease control programmes and health systems: an analytical approach to sustainability. *Health Policy Plan,* 30**,** 368-85.

STRINGARI-MURRAY, S., CLAYTON, A. & CHANG, J. 2003. A model for integrating hepatitis C services into an HIV/AIDS program. *J Assoc Nurses AIDS Care,* 14**,** 95S-107S.

TRAN, B. X., OHINMAA, A., DUONG, A. T., NGUYEN, L. T., VU, P. X., MILLS, S., HOUSTON, S. & JACOBS, P. 2012. Cost-effectiveness of integrating methadone maintenance and antiretroviral treatment for HIV-positive drug users in Vietnam's injection-driven HIV epidemics. *Drug Alcohol Depend,* 125**,** 260-6.

TURNER, B. J., LAINE, C., LIN, Y. & LYNCH, K. 2005. Barriers and facilitators to primary care or human immunodeficiency virus clinics providing methadone or buprenorphine for the management of opioid dependence. *Archives of Internal Medicine,* 165**,** 1769-1776.

UNAIDS 2011. Integrated HIV, diabetes and hypertension services in Cambodia. *Chronic care of HIV and noncommunicable diseases: How to leverage the HIV experience* Geneva: UNAIDS.

WHO 2007. Everybody's business: Strengthening health systems to improve health outcomes. WHO’s framework for action. Geneva: World Health Organization.

WHO 2008. Maximizing positive synergies between health systems and Global Health Initiatives. Report on the expert consultation on positive synergies between health systems and GHIs. Geneva.

WOOD, S. A. 2008. Health care services for HIV-positive substance abusers in a rural setting: an innovative program. *Soc Work Health Care,* 47**,** 108-21.