

LONDON  
SCHOOL of  
HYGIENE  
& TROPICAL  
MEDICINE



LSHTM Research Online

Brennan, R.J; Sondorp, E; (2006) Humanitarian aid: some political realities - Humanitarian agencies must tackle political and logistical obstacles to their work. *BMJ*, 333 (7573). pp. 817-8. ISSN 1468-5833 DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1136/bmj.39002.408808.80>

Downloaded from: <http://researchonline.lshtm.ac.uk/10620/>

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1136/bmj.39002.408808.80>

**Usage Guidelines:**

Please refer to usage guidelines at <http://researchonline.lshtm.ac.uk/policies.html> or alternatively contact [researchonline@lshtm.ac.uk](mailto:researchonline@lshtm.ac.uk).

Available under license: Creative Commons Attribution Non-commercial  
<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/3.0/>

<https://researchonline.lshtm.ac.uk>

multicentre study on sexual relations among young people in developing countries.<sup>9</sup>

Improving sexual and reproductive health requires action by areas of society beyond the health sector. Poverty and sex inequality increase the vulnerability of women to sexually transmitted disease and HIV infection. Early child bearing and high fertility are barriers to improving the educational and economic status of women and young people.<sup>10</sup>

The Arab human development report emphasised that sexual discrimination is paralleled by prejudice against the young.<sup>10</sup> Patriarchal dominance and discrimination is worst when the two prejudices overlap—as in the case of young females. Religion is often used to rationalise old cultural traditions and social prejudices, as in the case of female genital cutting.<sup>11</sup>

Powerlessness shapes people's health and life. Alleviating poverty is one route to empowerment, and access to information and services is another. Supply of information and services is, however, not enough. Young people need to be seen as assets, not problems. They should not be denied access to education and services in the hope that they will remain ignorant about sexual health issues that society would rather sweep under the carpet. Information and education does not encourage promiscuity, it helps young people to make responsible decisions to prevent unwanted pregnancies and sexually transmitted disease.<sup>12</sup>

In this issue, Obermeyer reviews the evidence about HIV in the Middle East and North Africa.<sup>4</sup> Given the still relatively low prevalence of HIV and AIDS in most of the countries in this region, we have a window of opportunity to prevent what will otherwise be an epidemic, when the disease spreads beyond the high risk groups.<sup>12</sup> The cost of ignoring this window of opportunity will be high. Sexually active people must be given information and the ability to act on it through provision of services otherwise the opportunity will be lost. Preaching abstinence alone is not

enough. The millennium development goals in the Middle East will not be achieved if women and young people are powerless.

Mahmoud F Fathalla *professor emeritus*

(mfathall@intouch.com)

Department of Obstetrics and Gynaecology, Assiut University Egypt, PO Box 30, Assiut, Egypt

Hoda Rashad *research professor and director*

Social Research Centre, American University in Cairo, Cairo, Egypt

Competing interests: None declared.

- 1 United Nations. *Report of the international conference on population and development*. Cairo, 5-13 Sep 1994. United Nations A/Conference 171/13, paragraphs 7.1-7.11. New York: UN, 1994. [www.arabhumanrights.org/unconf/icpd/ga/aconf-171-13-add1-94e.pdf](http://www.arabhumanrights.org/unconf/icpd/ga/aconf-171-13-add1-94e.pdf) (accessed 13 Oct 2006).
- 2 Bhutta ZA, Belgaumi A, Abdur Rab M, Karrar Z, Khashaba M, Mouane N. Child health and survival in high burden countries of Eastern Mediterranean. *BMJ* 2006 doi: 10.1136/bmj.38979.379641.68.
- 3 DeJong J, El-Khoury G. Reproductive health of Arab young people. *BMJ* 2006 doi: 10.1136/bmj.38993.460197.68.
- 4 Obermeyer CM. HIV in the Middle East. *BMJ* 2006 doi: 10.1136/bmj.38994.400370.7C.
- 5 United Nations. *2005 world summit outcome*. A/RES/60/1, paragraph 57.g. New York: UN, 2005. <http://unpan1.un.org/intradoc/groups/public/documents/UN/UNPAN021752.pdf> (accessed 13 Oct 2006).
- 6 UN Millennium Project. *Report 2005 investing in development: a practical plan to achieve the millennium development goals*. New York: UN. [www.unmillenniumproject.org/reports/index\\_overview.htm](http://www.unmillenniumproject.org/reports/index_overview.htm) (accessed 13 Oct 2006).
- 7 World Health Organization Department of Reproductive Health and Research. *Skilled attendants at birth—2006 updates*. Geneva: WHO, 2006. [www.who.int/reproductive-health/global\\_monitoring/skilled\\_attendant.html](http://www.who.int/reproductive-health/global_monitoring/skilled_attendant.html) (accessed 13 Oct 2006).
- 8 World Health Organization. *Unsafe abortion—global and regional estimates of the incidence of unsafe abortion and associated mortality in 2000*. 4th ed. Geneva: WHO, 2004. [www.who.int/reproductive-health/publications/unsafe\\_abortion\\_estimates04/](http://www.who.int/reproductive-health/publications/unsafe_abortion_estimates04/) (accessed 16 Oct 2006).
- 9 Brown AD, Jejeebhoy SJ, Shah I, Yount KM. *Sexual relations among young people in developing countries. Evidence from WHO studies*. World Health Organization Department of Reproductive Health and Research. WHO/RHR/01.8. Geneva: WHO, 2001. [www.who.int/reproductive-health/publications/RHR\\_01\\_8/index.html](http://www.who.int/reproductive-health/publications/RHR_01_8/index.html) (accessed 13 Oct 2006).
- 10 United Nations Development Programme. *The Arab human development report 2002. Creating opportunities for future generations*. New York: UNDP, Regional Bureau for Arab States, 2002. [http://hdr.undp.org/reports/detail\\_reports.cfm?view=600](http://hdr.undp.org/reports/detail_reports.cfm?view=600) (accessed 13 Oct 2006).
- 11 Cook RJ, Dickens BM, Fathalla MF. Female genital cutting (mutilation/circumcision): ethical and legal dimensions. *Int J Gynecol Obstet* 2002;79:281-7.
- 12 Jenkin C, Robalino DA. *HIV/AIDS in the Middle East and North Africa—the costs of inaction*. Washington DC: World Bank, 2003. [www.wds.worldbank.org/serlet/WDSContentServer/WDS/IB/2003/10/25/000094946\\_03101004015921/Rendered/PDF/multi0page.pdf](http://www.wds.worldbank.org/serlet/WDSContentServer/WDS/IB/2003/10/25/000094946_03101004015921/Rendered/PDF/multi0page.pdf) (accessed 16 Oct 2006).

doi: 10.1136/bmj.39002.655000.80

## Humanitarian aid: some political realities

*Humanitarian agencies must tackle political and logistical obstacles to their work*

Analysis and  
Comment p 843

The scale of current humanitarian crises in the World Health Organization Eastern Mediterranean Region (EMRO) is vast and the legacy of past wars persists. Around 60% of the world's refugee population have fled EMRO countries,<sup>1</sup> and the region is host to half of the world's refugees. The Palestinian territories, Afghanistan, Iraq, and Sudan are four of the five main sources of refugees globally, while the Palestinian territories, Pakistan, Iran, and Syria are the world's major hosts of refugees. Many of these people have been "warehoused" for decades in long term camps. In addition, over a third of the 21 million "internally displaced persons"—people who have been forced from their homes but have not crossed national borders—are in EMRO countries. These are startling

statistics for a region that contains only 8% of the world's population.

Recent crises have highlighted problems faced by the global humanitarian aid community. These include the difficulty of achieving interagency coordination, poor documentation of humanitarian need, and the lack of security for aid workers. Each illustrates the close link between politics and humanitarian action.

In 1991 the United Nations set up the Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs (OCHA) to improve interagency cooperation. After a review of its work the "cluster approach" was introduced in 2005 to

improve humanitarian outcomes.<sup>2</sup> Lead agencies have been identified for key areas of humanitarian intervention and play a major coordination role (box). The WHO is the lead agency for the health cluster. It is responsible for forming partnerships with ministries of health and helping them conduct baseline assessments, develop response plans, and build the capacity of local health services. Early assessments of the impact of this approach have been mixed.<sup>3</sup>

Recent events in Lebanon have shown just how challenging humanitarian coordination can be. The Lebanese Ministry of Public Health has limited reach and authority. Hezbollah, the agency widely considered to be the most efficient and accountable, was not only belligerent in the recent conflict but is considered to be a terrorist organisation by many Western governments. Hezbollah had a good reputation as a provider of social services before the war and operated a network of clinics and hospitals at lower cost than other providers. Its reputation has improved since the ceasefire, because it provided cash grants quickly, restarted water supplies, and extended health care to the internally displaced population.

Western governments, the United States in particular, have clear rules that restrict their grantees from supporting alleged terrorist organisations. Yet international non-governmental organisations prefer to work through local agencies, especially when they are effective at national level. UN agencies and international non-governmental organisations need to step delicately in Lebanon to ensure that gaps in services are dealt with, duplication of effort is minimised, and constructive partnerships with local communities are established. Some coordination with Hezbollah or its partners is inevitable, although it is essential to avoid strengthening or legitimising the organisation.<sup>4</sup> Aid disbursements should be channelled only through groups who are not associated with militias or military activity.

Over the past 30 years civilians have been disproportionately affected by conflict, as an article in this issue by Musani and colleagues underlines.<sup>5,6</sup> Documenting the humanitarian needs of civilians is difficult. Excess mortality is the most useful measure, and data are usually collected through population based surveys, which are useful for documenting the impact of humanitarian relief, mobilising resources, and influencing policy.<sup>7</sup>

Problems with security and access can make consistent collection of accurate data hard, but political obstacles can pose greater problems. Despite several surveys there is considerable controversy over the death toll in Darfur,<sup>8</sup> in part because the Sudanese government seems to have little interest in allowing large scale surveys. In Iraq, the high mortality documented in a methodologically sound survey, which was far higher than that found in previous reports,<sup>9</sup> ran into political opposition in the US and United Kingdom.<sup>10</sup> Government officials' desire to refute or ignore uncomfortable findings must be countered by a determined effort to show the scale of humanitarian need by using objective and valid data.

Recent events in several EMRO countries highlight a third area of concern. Violence towards humanitarian staff has increased, making it hard to provide humanitarian assistance. In Darfur—for example, only half of the people who need assistance are now

receiving it.<sup>11</sup> The bombings of the UN and Red Cross headquarters in Baghdad in 2003 were dramatic examples of this problem. Since the signing of the Darfur peace agreement in May this year, more humanitarian workers have been killed there than in the previous two years. In Afghanistan, 27 aid workers were killed in the first eight months of 2006.

Recent research confirms the trend of increasing attacks on humanitarian workers, in particular of national staff.<sup>12</sup> These attacks form a breach of the Geneva Conventions. The reasons for this are complex and the solutions challenging. Deploying peacekeeping troops to troubled areas has proved difficult; the Sudanese government has refused deployment of a UN force in Sudan and the North Atlantic Treaty Organisation has struggled to convince its members to commit troops to Afghanistan. Further efforts to improve security to allow national and humanitarian agencies must be made, however, for without it, aid agencies are hamstrung. UN members and regional bodies, such as the African Union and Arab League, must end impunity for violators of international law, and those guilty of crimes should be brought to justice.<sup>11</sup>

Humanitarian aid has become more politicised. Humanitarian workers cannot reverse this alone but they can reduce its impact. They need to affirm humanitarian principles, commit to doing no harm, document the scale and nature of crises accurately, and hold decision makers accountable for their policies and actions.

Richard J Brennan *health director*

(Richard.Brennan@theirc.org)

International Rescue Committee, New York, NY 100168, USA

Egbert Sondorp *senior lecturer*

Conflict and Health Programme, London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine, London

Competing interests: None declared.

Further information on current crises in the EMRO region and the humanitarian response to it can be found on [www.reliefweb.int](http://www.reliefweb.int).

- 1 United States Committee for Refugees. *World refugee survey 2006*. [www.refugees.org/article.aspx?id=1565&subm=19&ssm=29&area=Investigate&](http://www.refugees.org/article.aspx?id=1565&subm=19&ssm=29&area=Investigate&) (accessed 5 Oct 2006).
- 2 Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs. *Humanitarian response review*. New York and Geneva: OCHA, August 2005.
- 3 Actionaid International. *The evolving UN cluster approach in the aftermath of the Pakistan earthquake: an NGO perspective* 2006. [www.actionaid.org/pakistan/images/ActionAid%20Report%20on%20UN%20Cluster%20Approach%20April%202006.pdf](http://www.actionaid.org/pakistan/images/ActionAid%20Report%20on%20UN%20Cluster%20Approach%20April%202006.pdf) (accessed 5 Oct 2006).
- 4 Anderson MB. *Do no harm: how aid can support peace—or war*. Boulder, CO: Lynne Rienner Publishers, 1999.
- 5 Brennan RJ, Nandy R. Complex humanitarian emergencies: a major global health challenge. *Emerg Med (Fremantle)* 2001;13:147-56.
- 6 Musani A, Shaikh I. Learning from conflict and disaster in the Eastern Mediterranean region. *BMJ* 2006 doi: 10.1136/bmj.38994.548125.94
- 7 Checchi F, Roberts L. *Interpreting and using mortality data in humanitarian emergencies: a primer for non-epidemiologists*. Network paper 52, Humanitarian Practice Network, London: Overseas Development Institute, 2005.
- 8 Hagan J, Palloni A. Social science. Death in Darfur. *Science* 2006; 313:1578-9.
- 9 Burnham G, Lafia R, Doocy S, Roberts L. Mortality after the 2003 invasion of Iraq: a cross-sectional cluster sample survey. *Lancet* (Published online first 12 Oct 2006).
- 10 Reuters UK. *Blair rejects estimate of 655,000 Iraqi deaths*. [http://today.reuters.co.uk/news/articlenews.aspx?type=topNews&storyID=2006-10-12T134912Z\\_01\\_L12893389\\_RTRUKOC\\_0\\_UK-IRAQ-DEATHS.xml](http://today.reuters.co.uk/news/articlenews.aspx?type=topNews&storyID=2006-10-12T134912Z_01_L12893389_RTRUKOC_0_UK-IRAQ-DEATHS.xml) (accessed 12 Oct 2006).
- 11 Egeland J. Rescue workers at risk. *Washington Times* 10 Sep 2006. <http://washingtontimes.com/commentary/20060909-101232-4959r.htm> (accessed 5 Oct 2006).
- 12 Stoddard A, Harmer A, Haver K. *Providing aid in insecure environments: trends in policy and operations*. HPG report 23. London: Overseas Development Institute, 2006.

doi 10.1136/bmj.39002.408808.80