"When someone becomes old then every part of the body too becomes old":

2 experiences of living with dementia in Kintampo, rural Ghana

3 Short title: Experiences of living with dementia in rural Ghana

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18 19

20

21

22

Studies have suggested that in African countries, symptoms of cognitive decline are commonly seen as part of "normal ageing" or attributed to supernatural causes. The impact of causality beliefs upon help-seeking is unclear. Likewise, there is a lack of evidence relating to how families cope with living with an older resident with dementia. Our study aim was to explore the sociocultural beliefs, understandings, perceptions and behaviours relating to living with dementia in Kintampo, Ghana. We conducted in-depth interviews with a total of 28 people, using a series of case studies among 10 older people living with dementia and their families. Results revealed that symptoms of cognitive impairment were generally linked to inexorable bodily decline seen to be characteristic of "normal" ageing. Stigma was therefore perceived to be non-existent. Whilst managing the costs of care was often a challenge, care-giving was largely accepted as a filial duty, commonly shared among female residents of large compound households. Families experimented with biomedical and traditional medicine for chronic conditions they perceived to be treatable. Our findings suggest that whilst families offer a coherent approach to the needs of older people living with chronic conditions including dementia, health and social policies are at odds with this. In future, it will be important to develop policy frameworks that: acknowledge the continued social and economic potential of older people and strengthen the existing approach of families, optimising the management of noncommunicable diseases within primary care.

Keywords: Dementia, qualitative research, ageing, help-seeking, Ghana

23 Background

Longer life expectancy and lower fertility are changing the demographic profile of sub-Saharan Africa (SSA), with the number of older people aged more than 65 expected to expand from 46 million in 2015 to 157 million by 2050 (I. A. Aboderin & Beard, 2015). Although the prevalence of dementia was once thought to be lower in SSA as compared with high income countries (Guerchet et al., 2010), a small but expanding epidemiological literature suggests that the prevalence may be similar across different world regions (M. Prince et al., 2013), with the number of people living with dementia forecasted to increase from 1.63 million in 2015 to 5.73 million by 2050 (Prince M, 2015).

There is a scarcity of knowledge relating to local understandings of dementia in sub-Saharan Africa. Studies have suggested that symptoms of cognitive decline are commonly perceived to be either a part of normal ageing (Ineichen, 2000) or attributable to supernatural causes (Mushi et al., 2014). It has been suggested that those who attribute dementia to the supernatural may be more likely to seek care from traditional and spiritual healers (Mushi et al., 2014; Uwakwe et al., 2009). Such explanatory models are also likely to influence coping behaviours of older people living with dementia and their families. Beliefs about causality may be linked to how communities perceive and interact with people with particular conditions. For example, in traditional societies, belief in supernatural causes has been linked to the stigmatisation of mental illness (Lauber & Rössler, 2007). Although in traditional societies, it has been observed that older people were honoured and respected (Chuks J Mba, 2007), there is some evidence that perceptions may be more ambivalent: although longevity is associated with knowledge and wisdom and thus deserving of respect, old age is simultaneously linked with sorcery and therefore associated with mistrust and suspicion (Faure-Delage et al., 2012).

Non-HIV-related dementia has been absent from public health and policy agendas in SSA. It is therefore important to consider the broader policy and practice context as this relates to older people in general, as the most relevant background to our work. Indeed, older people in SSA have generally been neglected by governments and non-governmental organisations alike (C. J. Mba, 2010). Although policy frameworks explicitly directed at ageing populations are beginning to emerge, these have yet to effect change in policy and practice: health and social systems therefore remain poorly equipped to meet the needs of older people. A lack of formal provision for the social and economic impacts of ageing means that family and household networks remain the key sources of social security in older age (Heslop & Gorman, 2002). However, it remains to be seen to what extent rapid socioeconomic change associated with "modernisation" is undermining the social processes which traditionally protect the material wellbeing as well as the social status of older people (Heslop & Gorman, 2002). For example, it has been suggested that transitions from subsistence farming to wage-based economies and an increased emphasis on formal education may have contributed to a devaluation of the role of older people and the level of support extended to them (I. Aboderin, 2004). Given that dementia is associated with high levels of dependence and complex needs for care (Sousa et al., 2009), it seems plausible that people living with dementia might be particularly vulnerable to any reduction in the level of family support extended to older people, particularly in settings like rural Ghana, where there is very little provision from the state.

Ghana has one of the region's largest populations of older people with 7 per cent of the population estimated to be aged over 60 in 2010, expected to increase to 12 percent by 2050 (C. J. Mba, 2010; WHO, 2013). People aged 70 years are eligible for free basic medical care under the National Health Insurance Scheme and are exempt from annual fees. Ghana has a National Ageing Policy, the main aims of which are to: strengthen community capacity to deliver healthcare for older people, expansion of palliative care, the integration of comprehensive healthcare for older people and

incentivisation of specialist training in geriatrics and gerontology for medical students. However, little progress has been made in the implementation of this policy, and the Ghana Health Service lacks an implementation plan ((Kwankye, 2013; World Health Organisation, 2014). Little research related to ageing and mental health has been carried out in this setting. Building on the work of the Kintampo Health Research Centre (KHRC) and the work of the 10/66 Dementia Research Group (DRG), we carried out a cross-sectional survey with a nested qualitative study among people aged 70 years or older in the Kintampo Health Demographic Surveillance Site (KHDSS). Our aim was to explore sociocultural beliefs, understandings, perceptions, and behaviours relating to living with dementia in Kintampo. Based on gaps in the evidence base, we were particularly interested to explore: i) understandings and experiences of dementia, including beliefs about causality and stigma, help-seeking behaviours; ii) care arrangements and the impact of caregiving.

Methods

69

70

71

72

73

74

75

76

77

78

79

80

81

82

83

84

85

86 87

88

89

90

91

92

93

94

95

96

97

98

99

100

102

103

104105

106

107

108

109

110

We conducted in-depth interviews with a total of 28 people using series of case studies among 10 older people living with dementia and their families. The overall aim was to obtain multiple perspectives on the experience of living with an older person with dementia (Crowe et al., 2011; Yin, 2009). This approach has been used successfully in the 10/66 DRG INDEP studies in Peru, Mexico, China, and Nigeria (Mayston et al., 2014), and by other research teams in Tanzania (Mayston et al., 2014) and Norway (Smebye, Kirkevold, & Engedal, 2012). The sampling frame was participants in our quantitative cross-sectional survey who were identified as cases of dementia through a preliminary processing of the data, using the 10/66 DRG short dementia diagnostic schedule (Stewart, Guerchet, & Prince, 2016). The 10/66 DRG algorithm has demonstrated excellent validity in identification of dementia cases in a wide range of low and middle income country settings (M. Prince, Acosta, Chiu, Scazufca, & Varghese, 2003). It was not feasible to obtain a clinical diagnosis in the context of this study. In settings where dementia is very rarely diagnosed in any part of the health system, a one stage, culture- and education-fair screening tool is amongst the most feasible and valid means of identifying dementia cases for the purpose of epidemiological research (M. Prince et al., 2003). When compared against results of the original 10/66 DRG algorithm, the short-schedule version attained sensitivity and specificity in detecting dementia that were equivalent to the high levels obtained using the original algorithm (Stewart et al., 2016). Given the established validity of this approach, as we would expect, distribution of cognitive test scores between our qualitative sampling frame and study participants without dementia were consistent with differences identified in studies carried out elsewhere in sub-Saharan Africa (Guerchet et al., 2010).

101 Setting

Our study was carried out in collaboration with the KHRC, in the Kintampo Municipality. Kintampo is located in the middle belt of Ghana in the Brong Ahafo Region. It is a rural community, with farming as the main economic activity (Owusu-Agyei et al., 2012). Kintampo is made up of 11 ethnic groups with Akan the largest group, comprising 25.0% of the total population. The average size of a household is 5 families, commonly resident within a compound made up of up to 10 separate blocks clustered together. Researchers have begun to explore undertaking dementia research in the KHDSS, which resulted in the translation of some components of the 10/66 Dementia Research Group assessment prior to our work. However, ours is the first study to use these instruments to carry out population-based research in this setting.

111 Sampling

Using the KHDSS register as our sampling frame, we identified 4222 people aged over 70 years at the start of data collection. Our sample size calculation for the quantitative study (from which our

qualitative sample was drawn) was based upon an anticipated dementia prevalence of 10 percent. In order to recruit the necessary 864 participants, we estimated that we would need to target older people aged 70 years and above within an 18km radius of the KHRC. Older people were eligible to participate if they: i) were verified in the KHDSS register as normally resident within catchment area during the study period, ii) understood information about the nature and purpose of the study, iii) agreed to participate and signed to acknowledge informed consent (thumb print with witness if lacking the literacy skills to be able to sign), iv) understood and spoke Twi. We excluded older people who were: i) not matched from the register, ii) verified in the KHDSS register but moved out of the study area or deceased.

NA, SN and 4 field supervisors visited households identified from the register and introduced the study. Information sheets and consent forms were verbally explained and left with households for 24 hours to enable potential participants to absorb and consider the information provided. Interviews were arranged with those who consented to participate. Participants were informed that their household might be selected to participate in a second qualitative interview. We completed quantitative interviews with 761 older people and their key informants. The 10/66 DRG short dementia diagnostic schedule identified 17 people with dementia (Stewart et al., 2016), which formed the sampling frame for the qualitative study.

We purposively selected 10 households based on characteristics that we thought might influence experiences of living with dementia, for example: sex, household size and structure, and age. Selection criteria were designed to maximise diversity among our sample. Our sample size was pragmatic, based on feasibility within the scope of our exploratory mixed methods study. We anticipated that this sample size would enable us to get close to saturation on our a priori topics of interest.

Recruitment and data collection

After completion of quantitative data collection and preliminary processing of data, two health researchers (NA and SN), with backgrounds in social sciences (demography, qualitative research methods) returned to households selected for participation in the qualitative study to carry out indepth interviews. In order to identify the key members of the household/family involved in practical care work, decision-making or economic support, we carried out a relationship mapping exercise with the head of household at the start of the interviews. We selected interviewees for participation on the basis of findings from this exercise, where possible our aim was to interview the older person themselves and the key people involved in their care. All interviews were audio recorded with the permission of participants. Field notes (key words, phrases, events, observations) were taken to supplement the data included in transcripts. Interviews were conducted from September to October 2015.

We used an adapted version of the 10/66 DRG INDEP study topic guide as a starting point for the development of our topic guide. The aim of INDEP was to study the economic impact and needs for care among older people in four low and middle income countries (Mayston et al., 2014). Given our focus on the lived experience of dementia, causality, care arrangements etc. we amended the INDEP topic guide to include Kleinman's explanatory model interview questions (Kleinman, 1980), in order to elicit responses on these topics. We carried out interviews in a narrative style. We selected this approach as a naturalistic way for interviewees to "tell their story" about the onset, course and impact of dementia (Jovchelovitch & Bauer, 2000; Muylaert, Sarubbi Jr, Gallo, & Neto, 2014): described by interviewers as "problems with memory, concentration and thinking which are serious enough to affect day-to-day living". We also included prompts to probe for responses related to any

- a priori topics of interest that were not covered in the narratives or where the interviewer felt the expansion of a particular theme would offer helpful insights, for example: asking about whether they had sought help for the problems described and their experiences of help-seeking for dementia.
- Ethical approval was sought and obtained from the King's College London Research Ethical Committee (REC) and Kintampo Health Research Centre's Institutional Ethics Committee (IEC).

164 Analysis

165

166167

168169

170

171

172

173

174

175

176

177

178

179

184

We transcribed all the interviews verbatim from the local language (Twi) directly into English using Microsoft word. We anonymised notes/transcripts from the field by redacting identifying details after transcription. The data were managed using Open Code 4.0 qualitative software (University of Umeå, 2013). NA and RM read the data repeatedly and familiarised themselves with the content. We used a framework approach for our analyses (Furber, 2010; Ritchie & Lewis, 2003). The framework approach facilitates use of a priori codes derived from literature as well as enabling new codes to emerge from the data. It also allows within case analysis as well as facilitates identification of crosscutting themes (Feilzer, 2010; Gale, Heath, Cameron, Rashid, & Redwood, 2013). Given our defined area of interest we were keen to look at similarities and differences in perspectives within families as well as identifying commonalities across households. We selected initial codes and subcodes with reference to published literature and a priori topics of interest. NA developed the initial coding framework, discussed and agreed with RM. Both researchers then independently applied framework to the dataset. Additional codes that emerged during our analyses were added to the framework. NA and RM then met to discuss their frameworks and coding. NA consolidated coding according to this framework. NA and RM met to discuss and mapped out themes.

180 Results

See Table 1 for a description of the characteristics of the households selected for qualitative interviews. Table 2. Describes categories, themes and sub-themes identified in our analyses and described in detail in our results.

Table 1. Household characteristics

No	Household code	Sex	Age	Co- residents	Primary caregivers	Household structure & arrangements
1	AS 0552	M	85	7	Spouse, son, & older grandson (not living in household)	Spouse, children & grandchildren
2	NN 0133	M	100	10	Spouse, & eldest son	Spouse, sons, nieces & other relatives
3	NN 0081	M	90	7	All	Spouse, daughter-in-law, grandchildren
4	AS 0533	M	73	2	Spouse & son (not living in household)	Spouse & tenant
5	OP 0088	F	85	10	Daughter and grandchildren	Daughters, grandchildren & great grandchildren
6	BB 0731	F	85	6	Daughter & granddaughter	Granddaughters & other tenants
7	PP 0010	F	77	9	Daughter and granddaughters	Daughters & grandchildren
8	AB 0075	F	80	6	Grandson	Daughter-in-law & 4 grandsons

9	AS 0815	F	82	8	Self, daughter-in-law & older grand child	Son, daughter-in-law & grandchildren
10	BN 0089	F	92	10	Self, daughter and grandchildren	Daughter & grandchildren

186

Table 2. Categories, themes and sub-themes

CATEGORIES	THEMES	SUB-THEMES
SYMPTOMS	Cognitive problems	Problems with language, getting lost
	Physical co-morbidities	Mobility, aches and pains, stroke, blood pressure, hearing/sight
UNDERSTANDINGS OF COGNITIVE SYMPTOMS	Ageing	Cognitive have no specific name, part of overall decline
	Grief	Grief perceived to be a precursor to onset of cognitive decline
	Witchcraft	Bewitchment caused cognitive symptoms
HELP-SEEKING	Biomedical services	
	Traditional services	Used in combination with biomedical/used because of perception of supernatural cause
COURSE OF COGNITIVE ILLNESS	Irreversible	
CARE ARRANGEMENTS	Gender	Decision-making
		Division of labour
ECONOMIC IMPACTS OF CARE	Income generation	Generally limited impact
	Multiple demands upon household finances	Costs of care occur in context of other crises- sickness, poor harvest,
	Indirect healthcare costs	essential building works Even with insurance, transportation, herbal medicine costs are problematic
	Uncertain illness trajectories	Future healthcare costs are unpredictable, which is problematic
STIGMA	Lack of stigma	Despite symptoms, older person is treated with respect

	Changing role	Value of older person as an advisor is reduced, physical work is replaced with more sedentary activities
Symptoms narratives		
Mental decline		
Caregivers of eight of conversed. Older relative lose concentration, say conversation, or say this "That was not how she then and now are different conversation of the conversation of th	our participants described wes were more likely to: veer only things that were perceived to be was but now she has change rent also nowadays she say	ged [paused] looking at how she used to be ys or does things that are not sensible some
things that she would not older participant]	ot say to anyone before, now	she says them freely" [HH OP0088, Daughte
I have been saying or		centration and it is as if she has not heard wha forgotten what we were talking aboutI don'
losing things (n=2), get to the toilet/wash (n=1	ting lost (n=2), failing to recog .). Despite the absence of sor	For objects or being forgetful or confused (n=4) gnise family members (n=1), unable to dress/gome of the more severe symptoms of dementions symptoms troubling. For example:
is a "dance" [music and dance. When you are no bring him back home w	d drumming] going on at the ot awake or you do not see hir then they see him outside at n	we also don't sleep. Often at times when there town centre then he will want to go there and m going out then you are relying on outsiders to ight [sighs] if nobody sees him then he walk are "IHH NNOO81, wife of older participant.

- around until someone who knows him brings him home." [HH NN0081, wife of older participant]
- Co-morbid physical health problems

- Caregivers often listed symptoms of physical health problems which co-existed alongside those associated with cognitive decline, such as: mobility problems (n=3); aches and pains (n=3); stroke (n=1); blood pressure (n=1); problems with hearing/sight (n=1).
 - "At first she was able to go to farm and gather firewood even when you try to stop her, she will not mind you ... she was very strong ... she will fetch all the firewood a tractor brings as if three young men went to fetch that firewood. Now she cannot even come out of her room not to even talk of going to the farm to gather firewood. When you ask her, she complains of joint pains and that she cannot walk... that is how I got to know that she has changed ... then I already mentioned to you that when I tell her something immediately I come back to ask again she has forgotten about it. So that too I have seen that she has changed." [HH BB0731, Daughter of older participant]
- Making sense of mental and physical decline

- 223 Ageing
- 224 Ageing was the factor most commonly understood to underlie cognitive symptoms, reported by
- caregivers in relation to eight older relatives. One family specifically related the onset of symptoms
- 226 to the time of their mother's menopause. There was an understanding that the passage of time
- inevitably led to the decline of the body and mind in humans, related with the wear and tear seen in
- 228 objects or decay witnessed in other natural things:
- "If there is a leaf which is very green and now it had turned yellow, you now start thinking 'when will
- this leaf fall down'...we sometimes think...what will happen...but God alone knows the end"
- 231 [HH NN 0081; Wife of older participant]
- 232 When asked what they called the condition associated with cognitive symptoms (eg. Difficulties
- 233 holding a conversation, losing thing, getting lost etc.) participants stated that they had no
- 234 specific word for this condition or someone experiencing these kinds of symptoms, rather,
- 235 "the only name we know is someone who has grown very old...'hangyena'" (HH AS0815; son of
- 236 older participant).
- One caregiver of an older lady (her grand-son) clearly related her problems to deterioration
- over time of the brain:
- 239 "You know when you buy something new and you use it for a long time it becomes old...it does
- 240 not remain like you bought it. I think that is how the human brain is...when you are young it
- 241 works well
- but when you grow old it does not work well...so when someone becomes old then every part of
- the body too becomes old"
- 244 [HH AB 0075; Grandson of older participant]
- 245 Grief
- 246 Grief related to the recent deaths of close relatives was thought to contribute to the onset of
- cognitive symptoms according to three study participants (an older lady, and two caregivers for
- 248 different older participants):
- "It is not because I am aging that is why I am behaving this way...if you have eight children and four
- of them suddenly die...now you only have four of them what will you do? When this girl's (referring
- to a toddler on lap) mother died, five days later another one who lives in Kintampo also passed
- 252 *away"* 0089
- 253 Witchcraft
- 254 Witchcraft was identified as a causal factor underlying symptoms by three participants: two
- caregivers (for different older people) and one older participant. One of the caregivers believed that
- although the older person had experienced a stroke, this event had been caused because the older
- 257 participant had been bewitched. The older person in question understood that his symptoms of
- 258 suddenly not being able to walk or talk were caused by a neighbour. For another caregiver, his
- 259 father's problems also had a supernatural cause:

- 260 "hmmm what I can tell you is that at times he can go somewhere and someone will have to bring him
- 261 back to the house. Then there are some things in this house that he cannot lift but I noticed that
- sometimes he will be filled with some powers and because he is not himself he tries to lift those
- things like some easy thing...sometimes too he will run and climb very tall trees. That was when I
- realized that something was wrong with him. So, I contacted my uncle at Baniantwe and he said that
- at first the dwarfs wanted to possess him and he did not like it, so that is why he sometimes behaves
- 266 like that" 0533
- 267 Help-seeking
- 268 Biomedical services
- 269 Participants reported that all of the older people in our qualitative sample had visited the hospital
- since the onset of cognitive symptoms. Physical health symptoms were generally the impetus for
- accessing health services. Cognitive symptoms were not generally reported to healthcare workers:
- they were considered to be consistent with deteriorating health but not a sickness per se:
- 273 "As I said before we took him because he complains of the stomach ache, pains in his knees or if he
- 274 has body pains ... that is what we go and tell health workers ... then they will give his medicine for the
- ailments ...we have never reported his behaviour to the doctor ... we think its old age ... it is not
- 276 sickness so that is why we did not tell the doctor" [HH NN 0081; Wife of older participant]
- 277 One caregiver reported mentioning to the healthcare worker the problems their father was having
- with reasoning and conversation. The healthcare worker diagnosed high blood pressure, provided
- 279 medication for this and advised that alcohol and salt should be reduced in his diet. The cognitive
- 280 problems were not directly addressed and the family observed no improvements in these
- symptoms In fact it was rare for the older person to receive a diagnosis for any of the problems
- presented to the healthcare worker. More commonly, they were provided with medication without
- 283 further advice or information..
- 284 Traditional medicine
- 285 In five households, traditional medicine (usually herbal) was used in lieu of or in combination with
- 286 "white man's medicine" to treat the older person's health problems. Families evaluated both
- treatment models in a similar way. If herbal treatments were found to be ineffective, families might
- switch to biomedical treatments and vice versa. Sometimes herbal and biomedical treatments were
- used in combination, with the aim of addressing different aspects of the same problem:
- 290 "When it happened we were told that we can only use traditional medicine because of the nature of
- the fracture ... and that is what we did ... we were told to put some herbs on the affected area after
- 292 we had massaged the area with a hot stone ...other times to I buy some drugs that works on the
- 293 bones for her to swallow" [HH BB0731; Daughter of older participant
- 294 In the two families who believed supernatural forces were the primary cause of cognitive symptoms,
- 295 although biomedicine was accessed for physical illness, traditional medicine was believed to be the
- only appropriate treatment for this problem:
- 297 "When it started he could not talk or walk...we did not send him to hospital to treat this kind of
- 298 illness...we only used the traditional medicine and we saw that there was an improvement because
- 299 he could walk..."

- 300 [HH NN 0133; Son of older participant
- 301 Course of illness
- 302 Overall, it was generally acknowledged that improvements in symptoms of sickness of older relatives
- 303 (including those with a supernatural cause) might be partial and that it might not be possible to halt
- 304 natural decline. Generally, families aim was to treat what they could, in order to see an
- improvement in the level of comfort of their older relative:
- 306 "No...no...I don't believe it will improve...it will get worse...but maybe if we get medicine for her she
- 307 might feel okay" [HH AB 0075; Grandson of older participant
- 308 Care arrangements
- 309 Gender
- 310 Female relatives were the hands on caregivers in all households. All of the men had wives who were
- 311 the primary caregivers. All six of the female participants were widows. Where there was a man
- 312 involved in day-to-day activities with the older person, they identified themselves as the primary
- 313 caregiver; in these cases, they made decisions about care and treatment and were responsible for
- 314 finances, arranged transport to healthcare appointments, supervised medication. But in each of
- these households, the wife of the older person and other women in the household assisted the older
- person with other activities of daily life: bathing, preparing food, dressing, toileting, ensuring they
- were not left alone (for fear of getting lost). Being a caregiver for a husband was an integral part of
- being a wife, and by extension, providing care for the older members of a husband's family was a
- 319 natural extension of this role as wife and daughter-in-law. Others became de facto caregivers
- 320 because of their geographical proximity to the older person and the absence of possible candidates
- for the role. For example, a son who was a caregiver described how all of his siblings had relocated
- 322 to the city, leaving him and his wife as the only suitable caregivers for his mother; for one grand-son
- 323 who was a caregiver for his grandmother, the polygamous marriage of his father meant that he
- 324 spent several months of the year in the North of the country:
- "I can send her to the hospital and then call and tell him [his father] about it later...then he will tell
- me what I should do or he will come if he has to be here."
- 327
- 328 [HH AB 0075; Grandson of older participant
- 329 Decision-making
- 330 Whilst decision-making was a primary component of the role of male caregivers, some female
- caregivers were both decision-maker and hands-on carer (usually daughters of the older person).
- 332 Some primary caregivers made unilateral decisions about treatment, informing those family
- 333 members not resident in the compound, but who might be expected to contribute financially to the
- care of the older person, after the decision had been made and treatment accessed:
- 335 "I will usually send him to the hospital first and then inform my other siblings later on... I will have to
- look for money and send him...at times too my other siblings can bring a car from Kintampo to send
- 337 him to the hospital...we also have other relatives who help when papa is unwell. However, here in
- this village I take care of everything and even his insurance."
- 339 [HH AS 0533; Son of older participant]

- 340 In other cases, the approach to treatment and care was discussed by the family, with roles and
- responsibilities, including financing, hands-on care and decision-making about treatment was jointly
- 342 agreed:
- "One person cannot decide on this issue. It was the decision of the family members that, where
- 344 Grandpa's age has gotten to it is important we take good care of him. I mentioned this earlier on that
- those who have travelled contribute their monies and send the foodstuffs we buy to them. My
- grandmother is there with other family members so those living with him help him with his daily
- activities ... when it comes to bathing, my grandmother is responsible; for his meals, it is my
- 348 grandmother. My uncle and my aunties ... they share those responsibilities and make sure that it's
- 349 been taken care of..."
- 350 [HH AS 0052; Grandson of participant]
- 351 Division of labour
- 352 In general, caregiving was a collective activity, with hands on care duties shared among the female
- 353 members of the large compound households in which the older people lived. Sometimes these
- 354 arrangements were co-ordinated by a primary caregiver but more commonly these arrangements
- 355 appeared to be more organic, with those most involved in care able to rely on supplementary
- 356 support as and when this was necessary:
- 357 "Yes...since there are many of her grandchildren around the duties have been shared amongst them.
- 358 Initially when you tell them to prepare food they will be looking at each other not knowing who to do
- what...when you do not mention someone's name then they will be sitting down...so I met with them
- and apportioned duties for each of them. The schedule is changed every three days to ensure that
- 361 each and every one is doing something"
- 362 [HH BN 0089; Daughter of older participant]
- 363 Economic impact
- 364 *Income generation*
- 365 Where care needs were minimal and practical care was shared among many, the impact upon
- income generating or subsistence activities was perceived to be limited:
- 367 "Maame's condition has not reduced the work I do in any way...even if I go to farm there is someone
- 368 who helps to care for her...we are many here so every time there is someone at home so if you are
- not at home you are not worried. Maame also has many grandchildren it is not a problem to leave
- 370 her for a while and go to the farm to work...they take care of her needs...she can also do some things
- 371 for herself"
- 372 [HH OP 0088; Daughter of older participant]
- 373 Multiple demands
- Taking care of the older person occurred in the context of multiple demands upon family finances,
- with the children of the older person commonly supporting their own young families. Given this
- backdrop of already stretched finances, crises, such as poor harvest, sickness of a family member or
- 377 essential building works, were particularly challenging and commonly necessitated requests for
- funds from family members outside the immediate household:

- "As you can see these days money is difficult to get...all of my other siblings are married and have
- 380 children to take cater for...they pay school fees and other things so in terms of money it is very
- difficult to come by...but when this building almost collapsed it was my sister who gave us money to
- rebuild and maintain it. When I also fell sick my sister gave me money to go to the hospital and they
- told me it was high fever...you see when we were rebuilding the house I roofed the house and a nail
- pricked me the time I was doing it but I did not tell anyone...my foot swelled and I could not wear a
- 385 *shoe..."*
- 386 [HH AS 0533; Son of older participant]
- 387 *Indirect costs*
- 388 Most of the older people we interviewed had public health insurance (although in at least one case
- this had lapsed). This was generally perceived positively by the families. However, transport and
- 390 herbal medicine remained a significant cost. Some of those who were uninsured reported that
- 391 economic constraints limited access to treatment:
- 392 "I am talking of the means...that is money to send her somewhere for her condition to be treated...we
- 393 don't have it...I am even talking about her eye problem, if I send her to the hospital they can treat her
- 394 ...but I don't have the means...if I had, I would look for treatment for her eye problem to go away so
- 395 that she can see well"
- 396 [HH AS 0815; Son of older participant]
- 397 Uncertain trajectories
- 398 For this family, the uncertainty of the trajectory of the health of the older lady and the management
- of future costs associated with illness was a source of concern:
- 400 "we know that she will not live forever and she will die one day...she can live very long or even die
- 401 tomorrow but when she grows very old and has all kinds of small, small illnesses that is where the
- 402 problem can be...we don't know when she will tell us this part is paining her and we two we don't
- 403 have the means"
- 404 [HH AS 0815; Daughter-in-law of older participant]
- 405 Stigma
- When prompted as to whether they felt that they or the older person had ever been treated badly
- 407 because of the condition of the older person, participants universally responded that the community
- 408 treated the older person well and with respect. This was felt to be manifest in friends and
- 409 neighbours greeting the older person, asking how they were doing, coming to visit, sit and talk with
- 410 them. Getting lost, difficulties in having conversations, forgetfulness were accepted as symptomatic
- 411 of ageing when exhibited among older people, rather than "madness". As such, older people
- 412 displaying these behaviours might experience some "teasing" from small children, but this was not
- felt to violate the respect that was felt to be owed to older people:
- "Son: Sometimes some of the young people tease him but they are not disrespectful..."
- 415 Interviewer: "Please in what ways do they tease him?"
- 416 Son: "The way he speaks...always calling death and saying he will die, he will die, something small
- 417 then he will say he will die. I keep on telling him that he will not die. If he will die, then on the spot he
- 418 will die...right now we do not consider anything he says...even when he is asking you for money he

- 419 will say give him "Simpoa" [previous currency that was being used]...so they make fun of him. Had it
- 420 not been that he is old we will say he is mad"
- 421 [HH AS 0533; Son of older participant]
- 422 Older people with these symptoms were routinely referred to as "childlike" by interviewees.
- 423 Changing role of the older person
- 424 This was linked to the transition in role of the older person, from being someone who was valued as
- a confidante and advisor to being someone who needed to be taken care of and whose opinion was
- 426 regretfully no longer trusted or valued. This change was experienced as a loss by close family
- 427 members:
- 428 "When she was a bit younger, I used to come to her for advice which was very useful when I followed
- 429 it...but now if I come and ask her for advice...what she will say does not bring anything good in my
- 430 life...I have realized I do not have anyone who will advise me again ...when I think about these things
- then I begin to cry...that is why I say I am worried about her condition now"
- 432 [HH AS 0815; Son of older participant]
- Other aspects of the transition in the role of the older appeared easier for families to manage. For
- example, although it was recognised that it was no longer possible for the older person to carry out
- farming or go to market as they once did, the value of occupation was recognised by families and
- 436 older people were encouraged and supported to carry out alternative meaningful activities:
- 437 "...she can do a lot of things on her own with her hands and when she is sitting down...you can see
- 438 her de-husking the maize for the poultry..."
- 439 [HH AB 0075; Grandson of older participants]
- 440 Discussion
- Our study was designed to examine experiences of dementia. However, we found that it was not
- always possible or appropriate to separate experiences of dementia from those of other chronic
- 443 conditions. Consistent with qualitative research carried out in Tanzania (Mushi et al., 2014),
- 444 participants reported that they had no specific term for people living with dementia, rather they
- were referred to as "hangyena", translated as "very old". Comparable with the metaphor of an old
- 446 car identified in a different qualitative study carried out among traditional and faith healers in
- Tanzania (Hindley et al., 2016), participants in our study conceptualised problems associated with
- ageing as accumulated "wear and tear" over time due to usage. Although within this holistic model,
- participants sometimes made a distinction between body and mind (Patel, 1995) (linking symptoms
- of cognitive impairment with wear and tear of the brain) dementia was not always the salient
- 451 element of participants' experience. Participants viewed the health of older people holistically,
- describing the overall collection of symptoms observed and responding to needs for treatment and
- care (to which dementia contributed) as they arose. This reflects experiences of health and sickness
- of older people and their families around the world, where multi-morbidity is common and broad
- outcomes such as disability and needs for care are more salient and important to older people and
- 456 their families than diagnosis and aetiology.
- 457 Perceived aetiology did however play a role in shaping the character of help-seeking. As has been
- 458 found elsewhere, families who believed witchcraft to be the primary cause of cognitive symptoms
- opted for traditional healing in the first instance (Dale & Ben-Tovim, 1984). However, families who

identified "ageing" as the primary cause tended to experiment with biomedical and traditional treatments, switching services when a particular treatment was found to be ineffectual. Ultimately, many of the symptoms of old age were understood to be untreatable and characteristic of inexorable decline. Participants commonly located cognitive symptoms in this category. However, in a setting where there is low recognition of chronic conditions associated with old age among health professionals (de-Graft Aikins, Addo, Ofei, Bosu, & Agyemang, 2012), it is difficult to ascertain what role this lack of services played in determining attitudes to help-seeking for chronic conditions, including cognitive impairment. The impact of the absence of appropriate services and the perhaps concomitant perception of the un-treatability of cognitive symptoms may have contributed to a lack of focus upon cognitive deficits in interview narratives.

Some of our findings provide an interesting contrast with those from the 10/66 Dementia Research Group INDEP study. In our site in rural Ghana, the work of caring appeared to be more seamlessly absorbed into the daily tasks of the women within large family compounds than for women in Latin America, China and Nigeria. Unlike among participants in our sites in urban Latin America, where some women were beginning to challenge their de facto role as caregivers to older family members (Mayston et al., 2014), none of the female caregivers we interviewed in Kintampo questioned their status. In addition, in other settings, the stresses and strains of being a caregiver and attempting to meet the costs of care were strong themes (Martin Prince, 2004; M. Prince et al., 2012), whereas in Kintampo, although participants expressed concern for the health of their family member, any adverse effects upon their own wellbeing were largely absent from our interviews. Only a minority of our interviewees described caregiving as a major constraint on their income generation activities. There are some obvious factors that may have contributed to these differences. It seems possible that traditional gendering of roles and the salience of seniority and filial obligations remain more strongly intact in this setting, retaining their influence in ordering relations and social actions (Udvardy & Cattell, 1992) . Certainly, from our interviews, it seems clear that compound household structures facilitated amicable distribution of care duties among many.. Interviewer field notes suggest that although most of the older people interviewed displayed symptoms of cognitive impairment, many of the signs and symptoms associated with severe dementia (eg. agitation, aggression, incontinence) found to be particularly associated with strain elsewhere, appeared to be absent (Ferri, Ames, & Prince, 2004). This may explain why cognitive symptoms did not appear to significantly change the shape of care arrangements.

Finally, given that the primary activities in the region are farming and small trade, with low participation in formal labour, particularly among women, the kinds of economic activities caregivers were carrying out were more flexible and likely to be closer to home than the jobs and careers of women living in urban Peru, Mexico and China (Mayston et al., 2014). Finally, health insurance appeared to mitigate the worst impacts of the costs of chronic conditions for some. It was clear that not all families were reaping the potential benefits of health insurance, although the reasons for this were unclear. Although the Government of Ghana's aim is equitable and universal access to a package of essential healthcare, like elsewhere, coverage remains stubbornly low: less than 50% among people aged older 70 years (World Health Organisation, 2014). Contributory factors include: a large non-formal healthcare sector, rural communities made up of small towns with poor roads, telecommunications which inhibit health service access (Agyepong & Adjei, 2008). Further research is necessary to understand the specific barriers to accessing health insurance among older people, although lack of awareness of fee exemption of those over 70 years from fees and equity of enrolment for poorer people have been highlighted as potential concerns (Lagomarsino, Garabrant, Adyas, Muga, & Otoo, 2012).

Although it was our aim to interview older people and their family members and older people consented to participate, their voices are largely absent from narratives. Despite the fact that research ethics committees commonly stipulate that researchers should ensure privacy during research interviews, this is often not possible, due to a lack of private space and the cultural inappropriateness of separating family members, particularly older people, for interview. In our case, interviews were largely carried out as a collective activity. Our results inevitably reflect this, with the Head of Household and main caregiver often the strongest voices. Although some older people did contribute (and sometimes contradicted other family members), in general, family members spoke on behalf of older people, even though, in many cases, it was clear to the interviewer that the older person understood and was capable of participating in the interview. In our view, this situation is unavoidable and is therefore something that researchers need to be aware of as a potential influence on results rather than something that they should necessarily seek to change. A key potential limitation of our study is the lack of clinical diagnosis of dementia among our participants. We were unable to select participants on the basis of important clinical characteristics such as sub-type and duration, which may have important effects upon the experiences of caregivers and older participants. It is difficult for us to separate experiences which are a product of culture from those which are a result of cognitive impairment. Nonetheless, given the proven validity of the algorithm and its constituent instruments in other low income settings, we are confident that the older participants in the qualitative study were, in fact, living with dementia. The symptoms of cognitive impairment described in qualitative narratives by participants triangulate the results of the 10/66 DRG short dementia diagnostic schedule. In a region where despite rapidly rising numbers of older people, and there is very little qualitative work designed to understand experiences of health in older age, we believe that our exploratory study is an important initial contribution to the evidence-base which will be necessary to develop effective policies and services in coming years.

Conclusions

506

507

508

509

510

511

512

513

514

515

516

517

518

519

520

521

522

523

524

525

526

527

528

529

530

531

532

533

534

535

536

537

538539

540541

542

543

544

545

546

547

548

549

550

Our findings demonstrate that families in Ghana have a coherent explanatory model for health problems associated with older age, characterised as natural decline, within which beliefs about symptoms related to cognitive impairment are nested. Alongside other related belief systems such as gender roles and beliefs about the importance of seniority and filial duty, beliefs about health, sickness and personhood in old age guide approaches to caregiving, help-seeking and the role of older people. In contrast, social policies and the health system are at odds with the experience and needs of older people and their families (World Health Organisation, 2014). It is important that policies acknowledge the continuing social and economic potential of older people, including those living with dementia, for example, the continued roll-out of social pensions, which have been found to have a positive impact upon the socioeconomic status of the entire household where the older person is resident (Heslop & Gorman, 2002). Specific challenges in the health system in Ghana include: the lack of guidelines for chronic disease care, erratic supply of essential drugs and equipment at facilities, lack of old age specialists, poorly trained healthcare workers with insufficient knowledge of common chronic diseases (de-Graft Aikins et al., 2012). There is emerging evidence that effective care for chronic diseases associated with old age, including dementia, can be delivered by non-specialist workers providing outreach to older people's home from primary healthcare centres in low and middle income country settings (Guerra, Ferri, Fonseca, Banerjee, & Prince, 2011; Jotheeswaran et al., 2015). This approach is one potentially cost-effective means to rapid scale-up of the services that will be needed to address the increase in chronic disease that will inevitably accompany rapid population ageing.

- 561 References
- Aboderin, I. (2004). Decline in material family support for older people in urban Ghana, Africa:

 Understanding processes and causes of change. *The Journals of Gerontology Series B:*
- *Psychological Sciences and Social Sciences, 59*(3), S128-S137.
- Aboderin, I. A., & Beard, J. R. (2015). Older people's health in sub-Saharan Africa. *Lancet, 385*(9968), e9-e11. doi:10.1016/S0140-6736(14)61602-0
- 567 S0140-6736(14)61602-0 [pii]
- Agyepong, I. A., & Adjei, S. (2008). Public social policy development and implementation: a case study of the Ghana National Health Insurance scheme. *Health Policy Plan*, 23(2), 150-160.
- 570 Crowe, S., Cresswell, K., Robertson, A., Huby, G., Avery, A., & Sheikh, A. (2011). The case study 571 approach. *BMC Med Res Methodol, 11*, 100. doi:10.1186/1471-2288-11-100
- 572 1471-2288-11-100 [pii]
- 573 Dale, J. R., & Ben-Tovim, D. I. (1984). Modern or traditional? A study of treatment preference for neuropsychiatric disorders in Botswana. *Br J Psychiatry, 145*, 187-192.
- de-Graft Aikins, A., Addo, J., Ofei, F., Bosu, W., & Agyemang, C. (2012). Ghana's burden of chronic non-communicable diseases: future directions in research, practice and policy. *Ghana medical journal*, 46(2 Suppl), 1-3.
- Faure-Delage, A., Mouanga, A. M., M'Belesso, P., Tabo, A., Bandzouzi, B., Dubreuil, C. M., . . . Nubukpo, P. (2012). Socio-Cultural Perceptions and Representations of Dementia in Brazzaville, Republic of Congo: The EDAC Survey. *Dement Geriatr Cogn Dis Extra, 2*(1), 84-96. doi:10.1159/000335626
- 582 000335626

592

593

594

595

596

597

598

599

- 583 dee-0002-0084 [pii]
- Feilzer, M. Y. (2010). Doing mixed methods research pragmatically: Implications for the rediscovery of pragmatism as a research paradigm. *Journal of mixed methods research*, *4*(1), 6-16.
- Ferri, C. P., Ames, D., & Prince, M. (2004). Behavioral and psychological symptoms of dementia in developing countries. *Int Psychogeriatr*, *16*(4), 441-459.
- Furber, C. (2010). Framework analysis: a method for analysing qualitative data. *African Journal of Midwifery & Women's Health, 4*(2).
 - Gale, N. K., Heath, G., Cameron, E., Rashid, S., & Redwood, S. (2013). Using the framework method for the analysis of qualitative data in multi-disciplinary health research. *BMC medical research methodology*, 13(1), 117.
 - Guerchet, M., M'Belesso, P., Mouanga, A. M., Bandzouzi, B., Tabo, A., Houinato, D. S., . . . Preux, P. M. (2010). Prevalence of dementia in elderly living in two cities of Central Africa: the EDAC survey. *Dement Geriatr Cogn Disord*, 30(3), 261-268. doi:10.1159/000320247
 - Guerra, M., Ferri, C. P., Fonseca, M., Banerjee, S., & Prince, M. (2011). Helping carers to care: the 10/66 dementia research group's randomized control trial of a caregiver intervention in Peru. *Revista Brasileira de Psiquiatria*, 33(1), 47-54.
 - Heslop, A., & Gorman, M. (2002). Chronic poverty and older people in the developing world. *Chronic Poverty Research Centre Working Paper*(10).
- Hindley, G., Kissima, J., L. L. O., Paddick, S. M., Kisoli, A., Brandsma, C., . . . Dotchin, C. L. (2016). The role of traditional and faith healers in the treatment of dementia in Tanzania and the potential for collaboration with allopathic healthcare services. *Age Ageing*. doi:10.1093/ageing/afw167
- 605 Ineichen, B. (2000). The epidemiology of dementia in Africa: a review. *Soc Sci Med, 50*(11), 1673-606 1677. doi:10.1016/S0277-9536(99)00392-5
- Jotheeswaran, A., Dias, A., Philp, I., Beard, J., Patel, V., & Prince, M. (2015). Identifying common impairments in frail and dependent older people: validation of the COPE assessment for

- non-specialised health workers in low resource primary health care settings. *BMC Geriatr*, 15(1), 1.
- Jovchelovitch, S., & Bauer, M. W. (2000). Narrative interviewing. *Qualitative researching with text,* image and sound, 57-74.
- Kleinman, A. (1980). *Patients and healers in the context of culture: An exploration of the borderland between anthropology, medicine, and psychiatry* (Vol. 3): Univ of California Press.
- Kwankye, S. (2013). Growing old in Ghana: Health and Economic Implications. *Postgraduate Medical Journal of Ghana*, *2*(2), 88-97.
 - Lagomarsino, G., Garabrant, A., Adyas, A., Muga, R., & Otoo, N. (2012). Moving towards universal health coverage: health insurance reforms in nine developing countries in Africa and Asia. *The Lancet, 380*(9845), 933-943.
- Lauber, C., & Rössler, W. (2007). Stigma towards people with mental illness in developing countries in Asia. *Int Rev Psychiatry*, *19*(2), 157-178.
- Mayston, R., Guerra, M., Huang, Y., Sosa, A. L., Uwakwe, R., Acosta, I., . . . Wang, H. (2014). Exploring the economic and social effects of care dependence in later life: protocol for the 10/66 research group INDEP study. *SpringerPlus*, 3(1), 379.
 - Mba, C. J. (2007). Gender Disparities in Living Arrangements of Older People in Ghana: Evidence from the 2003 Ghana Demographic and Health Survey. *Journal of International Women's Studies*, 9, 153.
- 628 Mba, C. J. (2010). Population ageing in ghana: research gaps and the way forward. *J Aging Res, 2010*. doi:10.4061/2010/672157
 - Mushi, D., Rongai, A., Paddick, S. M., Dotchin, C., Mtuya, C., & Walker, R. (2014). Social representation and practices related to dementia in Hai District of Tanzania. *BMC Public Health*, 14(1), 260. doi:10.1186/1471-2458-14-260
- 633 Muylaert, C. J., Sarubbi Jr, V., Gallo, P. R., & Neto, M. L. R. (2014). Narrative interviews: an important 634 resource in qualitative research. *Revista da Escola de Enfermagem da USP, 48*(SPE2), 184-635 189.
- Owusu-Agyei, S., Nettey, O. E., Zandoh, C., Sulemana, A., Adda, R., Amenga-Etego, S., & Mbacke, C. (2012). Demographic patterns and trends in Central Ghana: baseline indicators from the Kintampo Health and Demographic Surveillance System. *Glob Health Action, 5*, 1-11. doi:10.3402/gha.v5i0.19033
- 640 19033 [pii]

618

619

625

626

627

630

631

- Patel, V. (1995). Explanatory models of mental illness in sub-Saharan Africa. *Soc Sci Med, 40*(9), 1291-1298.
- Prince, M. (2004). Care arrangements for people with dementia in developing countries. *Int J Geriatr Psychiatry*, *19*(2), 170-177.
- Prince, M., Acosta, D., Chiu, H., Scazufca, M., & Varghese, M. (2003). Dementia diagnosis in developing countries: a cross-cultural validation study. *Lancet, 361*(9361), 909-917. doi:S0140-6736(03)12772-9 [pii]
- 648 10.1016/S0140-6736(03)12772-9
- Prince, M., Brodaty, H., Uwakwe, R., Acosta, D., Ferri, C. P., Guerra, M., . . . Liu, Z. (2012). Strain and its correlates among carers of people with dementia in low-income and middle-income countries. A 10/66 Dementia Research Group population-based survey. *Int J Geriatr Psychiatry*, 27(7), 670-682. doi:10.1002/gps.2727
- Prince, M., Bryce, R., Albanese, E., Wimo, A., Ribeiro, W., & Ferri, C. P. (2013). The global prevalence of dementia: A systematic review and metaanalysis. *Alzheimers & Dementia, 9*(1), 63-75. doi:10.1016/j.jalz.2012.11.007
- Prince M, W. A., Guerchet M, Ali G C, Wu Y-T, Prina M, ADI. (2015). World Alzheimer Report 2015:

 The Global Impact of Dementia: an analysis of prevalence, incidence, costs and trends.

 Retrieved from London:

- Ritchie, J., & Lewis, J. (2003). *Qualitative Research Practice A Guide for Social Science Student and Researchers*: SAGE.
- Smebye, K. L., Kirkevold, M., & Engedal, K. (2012). How do persons with dementia participate in decision making related to health and daily care? A multi-case study. *BMC health services* research, 12(1), 241.
 - Sousa, R. M., Ferri, C. P., Acosta, D., Albanese, E., Guerra, M., Huang, Y., . . . Prince, M. (2009). Contribution of chronic diseases to disability in elderly people in countires with low and middle incomes a 1066 Dementia Research Group population based survey. *374*
- Stewart, R., Guerchet, M., & Prince, M. (2016). Development of a brief assessment and algorithm for ascertaining dementia in low-income and middle-income countries: the 10/66 short dementia diagnostic schedule. *BMJ Open, 6*(5), e010712. doi:10.1136/bmjopen-2015-010712
- 672 bmjopen-2015-010712 [pii]

665 666

667

675

676

677

678

679

680 681

682

683

684

685 686

- Udvardy, M., & Cattell, M. (1992). Gender, aging and power in sub-Saharan Africa: Challenges and puzzles. *J Cross Cult Gerontol*, *7*(4), 275-288. doi:10.1007/BF01848695
 - University of Umeå, S. (2013). OpenCode 4.0.: ICT Services and System Development and Division of Epidemiology and Global Health. Retrieved from http://www.phmed.umu.se/english/divisions/epidemiology/research/open-code/?languageId=1
 - Uwakwe, R., Ibeh, C. C., Modebe, A. I., Bo, E., Ezeama, N., Njelita, I., . . . Prince, M. J. (2009). The epidemiology of dependence in older people in Nigeria: prevalence, determinants, informal care, and health service utilization. A 10/66 dementia research group cross-sectional survey. *J Am Geriatr Soc, 57*(9), 1620-1627. doi:10.1111/j.1532-5415.2009.02397.x
 - WHO. (2013). Ghana: looking after its older people. Retrieved from http://www.who.int/features/2013/ghana-living-longer/en/
 - World Health Organisation. (2014). Ghana country assessment report on ageing and health (9241509317). Retrieved from
- 687 Yin, R. K. (2009). Case Study Research Design and Methods (4th ed. Vol. 5): SAGE.