SCIENTIFIC REPORTS

Received: 30 October 2017 Accepted: 26 March 2018 Published online: 23 April 2018

OPEN Allostatic load as a predictor of grey matter volume and white matter integrity in old age: The Whitehall II **MRI** study

Enikő Zsoldos 2^{1,2}, Nicola Filippini^{1,2}, Abda Mahmood¹, Clare E. Mackay^{1,3}, Archana Singh-Manoux^{6,5}, Mika Kivimäki^{6,4}, Mark Jenkinson² & Klaus P. Ebmeier¹

The allostatic load index quantifies the cumulative multisystem physiological response to chronic everyday stress, and includes cardiovascular, metabolic and inflammatory measures. Despite its central role in the stress response, research of the effect of allostatic load on the ageing brain has been limited. We investigated the relation of mid-life allostatic load index and multifactorial predictors of stroke (Framingham stroke risk) and diabetes (metabolic syndrome) with voxelwise structural grey and white matter brain integrity measures in the ageing Whitehall II cohort (N = 349, mean age = 69.6 (SD 5.2) years, N (male) = 281 (80.5%), mean follow-up before scan = 21.4 (SD 0.82) years). Higher levels of all three markers were significantly associated with lower grey matter density. Only higher Framingham stroke risk was significantly associated with lower white matter integrity (low fractional anisotropy and high mean diffusivity). Our findings provide some empirical support for the concept of allostatic load, linking the effect of everyday stress on the body with features of the ageing human brain.

Between 2015–2050 the world's population aged over 60 will have doubled to 2 billion¹. Perceived everyday stress^{2,3} and stress-related disorders are common⁴. The individual's physiological stress-response to a challenging stimulus⁵ is adaptive in the short run but if it is unremitting it can accelerate ageing, promote the onset of age-related diseases, and shorten life⁶.

The allostatic load index quantifies the adverse effects of chronic stress on peripheral organ systems⁷. It summarizes the multisystem physiological response to prolonged or repeated psychological stress and includes cardiovascular, metabolic and inflammatory components at subclinical levels (hence often referred to as secondary markers; for a review, see^{8,9}). Allostatic load is the conceptual basis for a comprehensive assessment of risk in the ageing process. Indexing allostatic load is linked to accelerated ageing¹⁰ and stress-related illnesses that are more prevalent among older adults, such as a decline in physical functioning and cognition, an increase in incident cardiovascular events and depressive symptoms^{11,12}, and an increase of all-cause mortality risk¹³. The allostatic load index is a better predictor of health-related outcomes in old age than its individual components, which indicates the overall impact of physiological dysregulation across multiple systems that over time reach subclinical levels¹¹.

The hippocampus, amygdala and the prefrontal cortex act as regulators, while the hypothalamic-pituitary-adrenal axis, the cardiovascular-, metabolic- and immune systems are effectors of the chronic stress response and allostatic load⁹. Despite its central role in the stress response and being a target of it^{14,15}, brain research of the effect of allostatic load index is limited to particular conditions, such as schizophrenia^{16,17} and late-life depression¹⁸. An inverse association of the index with total brain and white matter volume, a positive (sic!) association with left hippocampal volume, and no association with global grey matter and right hippocampal volume were observed after standardizing all volumetric measures for intracranial volume to account for variations in individual brain size in the Lothian birth

¹Department of Psychiatry, University of Oxford, Warneford Hospital, Oxford, OX3 7JX, UK. ²Wellcome Centre for Integrative Neuroimaging, Oxford Centre for Functional MRI of the Brain, Nuffield Department of Clinical Neurosciences, University of Oxford, John Radcliffe Hospital, Oxford, OX3 9DU, UK. ³Wellcome Centre for Integrative Neuroimaging, Oxford Centre for Human Brain Activity, University of Oxford, Warneford Hospital, Oxford, OX3 7JX, UK. ⁴Department of Epidemiology and Public Health, University College London, London, WC1E 7HB, UK. ⁵INSERM U1018, Center for Research in Epidemiology and Population Health, Villejuif, 94807, France. Correspondence and requests for materials should be addressed to E.Z. (email: eniko.zsoldos@psych.ox.ac.uk)

cohort (N = 633 (302 female), mean age = 72.5 (0.7 SD) years)¹⁹. More recently an inverse association of the index with grey and white matter volume and global fractional anisotropy, and no associations with white matter hyperintensity volume and global mean diffusivity were observed in the same cohort, after adjusting for sex at the age of 73 (mean age = 72.7 (0.7 SD) years, N = 657 (number of females not specified)²⁰.

The Framingham stroke risk score and metabolic syndrome are multifactorial predictors of incident stroke²¹ and diabetes²², irrespective of experienced stress. They comprise of cardio-metabolic measures, some of which are shared with the allostatic load index. The Framingham stroke risk is linked to reduced fractional anisotropy²³, and global and hippocampal atrophy²⁴. Metabolic syndrome is associated with grey matter volume reduction in the right nucleus accumbens and global cortical thickness²⁵, vascular brain changes in the form of periventricular white matter hyperintensities and subcortical white matter lesions in middle-aged individuals²⁶, reduced white matter integrity in fronto-temporal regions in middle-aged and older individuals²⁷ and silent brain infarction in older individuals²⁶.

We investigated the relation of the allostatic load index, Framingham stroke risk and metabolic syndrome with structural grey and white matter measures. Because of the similarity in their composite scores, we were specifically interested in whether any of these markers had a unique association with brain structure, and thus were better at predicting structural brain integrity. The notion that the allostatic load index merely reflects mechanisms that are associated with metabolic syndrome in older age was previously rejected²⁸. However, the three scores have not been formally compared in relation to structural brain outcomes. We used data from the Whitehall II imaging sub-study²⁹, where markers were measured prospectively, decades prior to a magnetic resonance imaging scan. We hypothesized (1) that these three markers are associated with widespread reduced grey and white matter integrity after controlling for relevant socio-demographic variables. We furthermore hypothesized (2) that despite their shared variance, the three markers make a quantitatively distinct and anatomically unique contribution to grey matter volume and white matter integrity, respectively.

Material and Methods

Participant characteristics. The sample was drawn from the first 563 participants recruited to take part in the Whitehall II imaging sub-study between April 2012 and December 2014²⁹ (https://bmcpsychiatry.biomedcentral.com/articles/10.1186/1471-244X-14-159). All participants were randomly selected from the Phase 11 examination of the Whitehall II ("Stress and Health") study, an on-going prospective occupational cohort study conducted at University College London. The study was originally designed to explore the biological pathways through which social circumstances affect health, with a particular focus on stress that manifests as social inequality at the workplace, and cardiovascular disease and mortality outcome^{30,31}. At baseline Phase 1, between 1985–1988, the Whitehall II study included 10,308 British civil service workers aged 35–55 (born between 1932– 1955), of whom 6,895 were men. Follow-up health examinations were conducted over the following 30 years, approximately every five years. The collection of biological measures has been described elsewhere^{32–35}. The present analysis uses data acquired at Phase 3 (1991-1994) and Phase 7 (2002-2004). Phase 11 took place between February 2012 and March 2013. A total of 74% of participants who took part in Phase 11 had reached or passed the statutory retirement age of 65. Ethical approval was obtained from the University of Oxford Central University and Medical Science Division Interdisciplinary Research Ethics Committee, and the University College London and University College London Hospital Committees on the Ethics of Human Research. All methods were performed in accordance with the relevant guidelines and regulations. All participants provided informed written consent.

Inclusion/exclusion criteria. Participants were excluded from analysis if they did not have a magnetic resonance imaging (MRI) scan, had noticeable structural abnormalities such as strokes, or poor image quality that pre-processing and artefact correction could not fix, or had a missing secondary stress marker at either phase.

Markers. The Framingham stroke risk score (FSRS) is a sex-specific stroke risk appraisal function that empirically relates cardiovascular risk factors to the probability of a stroke within 10 years²¹. It takes account of cardiovascular health, diabetes mellitus, smoking habits, sex and age. Metabolic syndrome (MetS) was defined based on the presence of at least three of the following five components³⁶: high blood pressure or use of antihypertensives, abdominal obesity, elevated fasting glucose, high-density lipoprotein (HDL) cholesterol, and serum triglycerides (Supplementary Table S1). The cut-offs for abdominal obesity and HDL cholesterol were sex specific. Allostatic load (AL) index was defined as the linear combination of nine physiological measures with values above a high-risk threshold³⁷: blood pressure, fasting glucose, fasting insulin, high- and low-density lipoprotein (LDL) cholesterol, serum triglycerides, C-reactive protein (CRP), and interleukin-6 (IL-6) (Supplementary Table S1). An elevated level of each measure carries more risk, except in case of HDL cholesterol. The sum of each score at Phase 3 and Phase 7 was entered into analyses, and are described in detail in Supplementary Text S1.

Assessment of nuisance variables. FSRS, MetS and AL index were included in a series of analyses, as either covariates of interest or no interest (nuisance variables). This was required to identify each marker's unique association with brain structure, having controlled for the variance it shares with the other markers and socio-demographic variables. Furthermore, age at time of scan, sex, ethnicity, education and employment grade were used as nuisance variables and are described in detail in Supplementary Text S1.

MRI acquisition and analysis. T_1 -weighted, and diffusion-weighted MRI images were acquired at the Oxford Centre for Functional MRI of the Brain (FMRIB), Wellcome Centre for Integrative Neuroimaging using a 3T Siemens Magnetom Verio (Erlangen, Germany) scanner with a 32-channel receive head coil, and were

pre-processed and analysed using FSL v.5.0 tools³⁸ described as part of the Whitehall II imaging sub-study protocol²⁹. Details on MRI acquisition and processing are provided in Supplementary Text S2.

Statistical analysis. Voxelwise general linear model (GLM) was applied for the analysis of grey matter and diffusion tensor imaging (DTI) data using Randomise³⁹, a permutation-based non-parametric statistical test, running 5000 permutations and correcting for multiple comparisons across space. The significance threshold was set at p < 0.05, using threshold-free cluster enhancement ((TFCE))⁴⁰. Three types of imaging-based statistical tests were run (details in Supplementary Text S3). (1) Simple linear t-tests of each marker in isolation, controlling for socio-demographics as nuisance variables:

$$\begin{array}{l} Y &=& \beta 1 \ FSRS + \beta 2 \ age + \beta 3 \ sex + \beta 4 \ ethnicity + \beta 5 \ education + \beta 6 \ employment + \epsilon \\ &=& 1, \ 0, \ 0, \ 0, \ 0, \ 0 \\ &=& -1, \ 0, \ 0, \ 0, \ 0 \\ Y &=& \beta 1 \ MetS + \beta 2 \ age + \beta 3 \ sex + \beta 4 \ ethnicity + \beta 5 \ education + \beta 6 \ employment + \epsilon \\ &=& 1, \ 0, \ 0, \ 0, \ 0 \\ &=& -1, \ 0, \ 0, \ 0, \ 0 \\ Y &=& \beta 1 \ AL + \beta 2 \ age + \beta 3 \ sex + \beta 4 \ ethnicity + \beta 5 \ education + \beta 6 \ employment + \epsilon \\ &=& 1, \ 0, \ 0, \ 0, \ 0 \\ Y &=& \beta 1 \ AL + \beta 2 \ age + \beta 3 \ sex + \beta 4 \ ethnicity + \beta 5 \ education + \beta 6 \ employment + \epsilon \\ &=& 1, \ 0, \ 0, \ 0, \ 0 \\ &=& -1, \ 0, \ 0, \ 0, \ 0 \end{array}$$

(2) F-tests of pairs of markers, controlling for the third marker and socio-demographics as nuisance variables in order to determine the relative importance of specific markers on brain structure. Whenever a significant F-test was found, further post-hoc t-tests (3) were run to see if controlling for two of the three markers and socio-demographics as nuisance variables also yielded a result.

$$\begin{split} Y &= & \beta 1 \; \text{FSRS} + \beta 2 \; \text{MetS} + \beta 3 \; \text{AL} + \beta 4 \; \text{age} + \beta 5 \; \text{sex} + \beta 6 \; \text{ethnicity} + \beta 7 \; \text{education} + \\ & & \beta 8 \; \text{employment} + \varepsilon \\ & & 0, -1, \; 0, \; 0, \; 0, \; 0, \; 0, \; 0, \; 0 \\ & & 0, \; 0, -1, \; 0, \; 0, \; 0, \; 0, \; 0, \; 0 \\ & & -1, \; 0, \; 0, \; 0, \; 0, \; 0, \; 0, \; 0 \\ & & -1, \; 0, \; 0, \; 0, \; 0, \; 0, \; 0, \; 0 \\ & & -1, \; 0, \; 0, \; 0, \; 0, \; 0, \; 0, \; 0 \\ & & -1, \; 0, \; 0, \; 0, \; 0, \; 0, \; 0, \; 0 \\ & & 0, -1, \; 0, \; 0, \; 0, \; 0, \; 0, \; 0 \\ \end{array}$$

Results were localized using the Harvard-Oxford cortical and subcortical structural atlases for voxel-based morphometry (VBM) and the John Hopkins University DTI-based white matter atlases for tract-based special statistics (TBSS).

Data availability. The study follows MRC data sharing policies [https://www.mrc.ac.uk/research/policies-and-guidance-for-researchers/data-sharing/]. Data will be accessible from the authors after 2019.

Results

(Abbreviations used: FSRS: Framingham stroke risk score; MetS: metabolic syndrome; AL index: allostatic load index; GM: grey matter; DTI: diffusion tensor imaging; VBM: voxel-based morphometry; TBSS: tract-based spatial statistics)

Descriptive statistics. Participant exclusion/inclusion. Participants with no T1 scan (N=11), with structural abnormalities (N=18) or inadequate quality T1 scan (N=2), missing Framingham stroke risk (N=25), metabolic syndrome (N=4) or allostatic load score (N=154) at either of the two phases, missing (N=9) or un-useable DTI scan (N=3) were excluded from analysis. VBM analysis was based on a final sample of N=349 and TBSS on N=337.

Socio-demographic variables. Mean follow-up time between Phase 3 and scan was 21.4 (SD 0.82) years. Participants were on average 69.6 (SD 5.2) years old. 80.5 percent in this study were male, with an average 14 years of education, which reflects the demographics of the British Civil Service in 1985 at recruitment to the Whitehall II study (Table 1). Marker characteristics used in the analysis are shown in Table 1 and Supplementary Table S2. Supplementary Table S2 summarizes their distribution in Phase 3 and Phase 7, and shows their increase across the two phases. Furthermore, 85% of participants were free from metabolic syndrome (MetS) and 38.7% of participants had an allostatic load (AL) index of less than 5, 50.2% between 5–9 and only 19.8% had an index from 10 to 15.

The three markers were positively correlated. Participants with a high Framingham stroke risk (FSRS) had a high MetS score (Spearman's rho (347) = 0.29, p < 0.001) and a high AL index (r_s (347) = 0.37, p < 0.001). Participants with a high MetS score also had a high AL index (r_s (347) = 0.53, p < 0.001). Males had significantly higher FSRS (t (347) = 8.93, p < 0.001) and AL index (t (347) = 2.75, p = 0.006) than females. MetS score was not significantly different between sexes (t (347) = 1.11, p = 0.27).

VBM (N = 349)	TBSS (N = 337)	
Socio-demographics		
69.6 (5.2), 60-83	69.5 (5.2), 60-83	
281 (80.5)	271 (80.4)	
325 (93.1)	313 (92.9)	
Occupation - N (%)		
149 (42.7)	142 (42.1)	
171 (49.0)	167 (49.6)	
29 (8.3)	28 (8.3)	
13.9 (3.0), 6–23	14.0 (3.0), 6–23	
Marker characteristics		
8.5 (4.5), 2-42	8.4 (4.4), 2-42	
9.47 (4.39), 6-42	9.34 (4.22), 6–42	
4.51 (2.55), 2–13	4.56 (2.57), 2–13	
0.19 (0.47), 0-2	0.18 (0.45) 0-2	
0.20 (0.50), 0-2	0.19 (0.47), 0–2	
0.13 (0.34), 0-1	0.14 (0.35), 0–1	
5.65 (3.03), 0-15	5.62 (3.02), 0-15	
5.86 (2.98), 0-15	5.84 (2.98), 0-15	
4.75 (3.0), 0–11	4.73 (3.04), 0–11	
	VBM (N = 349) 69.6 (5.2), 60-83 281 (80.5) 325 (93.1) 149 (42.7) 171 (49.0) 29 (8.3) 13.9 (3.0), 6-23 8.5 (4.5), 2-42 9.47 (4.39), 6-42 4.51 (2.55), 2-13 0.19 (0.47), 0-2 0.20 (0.50), 0-2 0.13 (0.34), 0-1 5.65 (3.03), 0-15 5.86 (2.98), 0-11	

Table 1. Population and marker characteristics for Whitehall II imaging sub-study participants in Voxel-basedmorphometry (VBM) and Tract-based spatial statistics (TBSS) analyses.

Voxel-based morphometry results. *Simple linear t-tests.* After controlling for socio-demographic factors, voxelwise analyses of grey matter (GM) showed that higher FSRS, MetS and AL index were each separately associated with lower GM density. Significant voxels predominantly fell in the right hemisphere for each marker. For FSRS, results were primarily located within the right medial temporal lobe. For MetS, significant voxels were in the right postcentral gyrus. For AL index, significant regions included the right insular cortex, pre-, postcentral- and supramarginal gyrus, and the left central and frontal operculum (Fig. 1, Supplementary Table S3).

F-tests. Only one of three F-tests showed significant associations with voxelwise GM. Significant associations of GM density with MetS or AL index or both extended to the right insular cortex, parts of the planum polare and Heschl's gyrus in the opercular cortex. Maximum F-statistics were located in the right insular cortex (Fig. 2, Supplementary Table S4).

Post-hoc t-tests. Post-hoc t-tests showed a significant association between AL index and lower GM density after controlling for MetS, FSRS, and socio-demographic variables. Significant voxels were located in the right hemisphere in regions along the insular cortex, opercular cortex (planum polare, Heschl's gyrus), superior temporal gyrus, and temporal pole (Fig. 2, Supplementary Table S4). No association of higher GM density was found with AL index, and no significant GM association was present with MetS. In summary, the markers could be ranked in terms of unique contribution to GM density as follows: AL > MetS > FSRS.

Tract-based spatial statistics results: Fractional Anisotropy (FA). *Simple linear t-tests.* After controlling for socio-demographic factors, voxelwise analyses of fractional anisotropy (FA) showed that higher FSRS was associated with lower FA. Significant voxels were located bilaterally in the corona radiata (anterior, superior and posterior), corpus callosum (genu, body and splenium), inferior fronto-occipital fasciculus, inferior longitudinal fasciculus, forceps major, superior longitudinal fasciculus, in the right hemisphere along the anterior thalamic radiation, corticospinal tract and internal capsule, as well as in the left posterior thalamic radiation. Maximum t-statistic was located in the body of corpus callosum (Fig. 3, Supplementary Table S4). There was no positive association of higher FA and FSRS values, nor were there any associations between FA and MetS or AL index.

F-tests. Only one of three F-tests showed significant associations with voxelwise FA. The significant unique associations of FA values with FSRS or MetS or both were localized in the body of corpus callosum, after controlling for AL index and socio-demographics as nuisance variables (Fig. 4, Supplementary Table S4).

Post-hoc t-tests. Post-hoc t-tests showed a significant association between higher FSRS and lower FA values after controlling for MetS, AL index, and socio-demographic variables. Significant voxels were located in regions found in association with FSRS after removing socio-demographic factors (section 3.4.1, Fig. 3 and Supplementary Table S3) but their number was markedly reduced in the inferior fronto-occipital fasciculus bilaterally, in the right anterior thalamic radiation and corticospinal tract, and were no longer present in the right inferior and superior longitudinal fasciculus, and right half of the forceps major (Fig. 5, Supplementary Table S4) compared with the t-test of FSRS above. There was no positive association of FA with FSRS, nor any FA associations with MetS. In summary, the markers could be ranked in terms of unique contribution to white matter FA as follows: FSRS > MetS > AL.



Figure 1. Simple linear t-tests of each marker and lower voxelwise grey matter density. T-tests show an association of higher Framingham stroke risk (top), metabolic syndrome (middle) and allostatic load index (bottom two rows) with lower voxelwise grey matter after removing the effects of socio-demographic variables. Blue represents regions significant at p < 0.05, threshold-free cluster enhancement, corrected for multiple comparisons. P, posterior; L, left. Coordinates are in MNI space.

.....

Tract-based spatial statistics results: Mean Diffusivity (MD). *Simple linear t-tests.* After controlling for socio-demographic factors voxelwise analyses of mean diffusivity (MD) showed that higher FSRS was associated with higher MD. Significant voxels extended regions seen in association with FA (section 3.4.1) and were more widespread. Maximum t-statistic was located in the left anterior thalamic radiation (Fig. 3, Supplementary Table S3). No association of higher MD values was found with FSRS, and no significant MD association was present with MetS and AL index.

F-tests. Two out of three F-tests showed significant unique associations with voxelwise MD. Both F-tests revealed widespread significant unique associations of MD values with FSRS or AL index or both as well as FSRS or MetS or both after removing the effects of socio-demographic variables. Both F-tests revealed findings bilaterally in the anterior thalamic radiation, corona radiata (anterior, superior and posterior), corpus callosum (body, genu and splenium), internal capsule, external capsule and forceps major. Associations with MD values were revealed in the right tract of the superior longitudinal fasciculus in the former, and bilaterally in the latter F-test. Maximum F-statistics were located in the left anterior thalamic radiation for both tests (Fig. 4, Supplementary Table S4).

Post-hoc t-tests. After controlling for MetS, AL index and socio-demographic factors, a significant widespread association between higher FSRS and higher MD values was present in regions seen in association with FSRS after removing socio-demographic variables. Voxels were more widespread in the forceps minor and major, frontal part of the inferior fronto-occipital fasciculus, and the left anterior corona radiata before controlling for the other secondary stress markers (section 3.5.1). After additionally controlling for the markers, results were slightly more widespread in the anterior thalamic radiata and posterior part of the fronto-occipital fasciculus. Maximum t-statistics were located in the left anterior thalamic radiation (Fig. 5, Supplementary Table S4). Lower MD values were not associated with FSRS, and no significant MD association was present with AL index or MetS. In summary, the markers could be ranked in terms of unique contribution to white matter MD as follows: FSRS > AL, MetS.



Figure 2. Top: F-test 1 of unique metabolic syndrome or allostatic load index association with grey matter after removing the effects of Framingham stroke risk and socio-demographic variables. Significant results extend the right insular and opercular cortex. Bottom: Post-hoc t-test shows an association between allostatic load index and lower voxelwise grey matter after removing the effects of metabolic syndrome, Framingham stroke risk and socio-demographic variables. Significant voxels were located along the right insular and opercular cortex, superior temporal gyrus and temporal pole. Blue represents regions significant at p < 0.05, threshold-free cluster enhancement, multiple comparisons corrected. P, posterior; A, anterior; R, right; L, left; Coordinates are in MNI space.



Figure 3. Simple linear t-test of Framingham stroke risk and lower white matter integrity. T-tests show an association of higher Framingham stroke risk with lower fractional anisotropy (FA; top) and higher mean diffusivity (MD; bottom) after removing the effects of socio-demographic variables. Results represent voxels significant at p < 0.05, threshold-free cluster enhancement, multiple comparisons corrected. Significant regions are dilated for illustrative purposes, overlaid on a green skeleton. P, posterior; L, left. Coordinates are in MNI space.

Discussion

We report findings from the first voxelwise study comparing three composite markers that have commonly been linked to stressors, health, and stress- and age-related disease. Hypothesis (1) was partially supported, i.e. Framingham stroke risk, metabolic syndrome and the allostatic load index were associated with lower grey matter density. Only Framingham stroke risk was associated with widespread reduced white matter integrity, namely lower fractional anisotropy and higher mean diffusivity values.

The markers had a unique association with structural brain integrity in older age after controlling for the effects of the other markers, and nuisance factors. However, the markers with the largest unique contribution were different for grey and white matter, respectively. A unique association of the allostatic load index measured



Figure 4. Top: F-test 3 of unique Framingham stroke risk or metabolic syndrome association with fractional anisotropy (FA) after removing the effects of allostatic load index and socio-demographic variables. Significant voxels are located in the body of corpus callosum. Bottom: F-test 2 (top) of unique Framingham stroke risk or allostatic load index and F-test 3 (bottom) of unique Framingham stroke risk or metabolic syndrome association with widespread mean diffusivity (MD) values. Results primarily extend the anterior thalamic radiation, corona radiata, corpus callosum, and internal and external capsule. Results represent voxels significant regions are dilated for illustrative purposes, overlaid on a green skeleton and corrected for multiple comparisons. A, anterior; R, right; L, left. Coordinates are in MNI space.





Figure 5. Post-hoc t-tests of Framingham stroke risk and lower white matter integrity. Post-hoc t-tests show an associations of higher Framingham stroke risk with lower fractional anisotropy (FA; top) and higher mean diffusivity (MD; bottom) after removing the effects of metabolic syndrome, allostatic load index and sociodemographic variables. Significant fractional anisotropy voxels extend bilaterally in the corona radiata, corpus callosum, forceps major, superior longitudinal fasciculus, in the right hemisphere along the anterior thalamic radiation, corticospinal tract and internal capsule, as well as in the left inferior fronto-occipital fasciculus and posterior thalamic radiation. Significant mean diffusivity voxels are present in similar regions but more widespread and less lateralised than with fractional anisotropy. Results represent voxels significant at p < 0.05, threshold-free cluster enhancement, multiple comparisons corrected. Significant regions are dilated for illustrative purposes, overlaid on a green skeleton. R, right; L, left. Coordinates are in MNI space.

.....

across two study phases was found with lower grey matter in the right hemisphere in regions along the insular cortex, opercular cortex, superior temporal gyrus, and temporal pole. A unique association between FSRS and widespread lower white matter was also found.

Grey matter (possible mechanisms). The allostatic load index was the best candidate marker to affect brain cortex, followed by the metabolic syndrome then Framingham stroke risk. It uniquely accounts for risk that is not related to vascular risk captured by the Framingham stroke risk or metabolic syndrome. A single study supports concurrently measured allostatic load in predicting MRI brain structure in older age¹⁹. In our study, the allostatic load index did not affect the brain structures typically predicted, such as the hippocampal formation and prefrontal cortex⁴¹. The location of effects in lateral temporo-frontal regions may coincide with the distribution of the middle cerebral artery. Infarcts are most common in this vascular territory^{42–44}, so this may point to a vascular nature of the underlying mechanisms. Although there is great variability in how the allostatic load index is derived, it is often calculated as the sum of the largest number of markers above respective thresholds⁹. This results in a large coefficient of variance making it more likely that an association is found. Although the Framingham stroke risk score had the largest variance, it is also closely associated with age, which is a strong predictor of grey matter atrophy⁴⁵, and if controlled for, removes the shared variance between the Framingham stroke risk score and grey matter.

The allostatic load index was the least associated with confounding variables, such as age, as largest associations with grey matter were found with allostatic load index after removing the effect of socio-demographic variables. Unlike in the case of the Framingham stroke risk score, age is not incorporated in the index⁹. Allostatic load is conceptualized as the accumulation of stress responses over time, thus it theoretically represents the accumulated damage of the allostatic process on the body over the life course⁴⁶. Although it is often assumed that allostatic load increases with the passage of time even if it was low in early adulthood¹⁹, a cross-sectional study found that, whereas allostatic load increased from the 20s into the 60s, levels of the index stabilized in the 70s and 80s⁴⁷. This could be a reflection of those with lower allostatic load index continuing to live into older age. To date only a few prospective studies support the applicability of the allostatic load and brain structure are needed in order to identify critical periods where the ageing brain is particularly sensitive to allostatic load, as well as studies that examine the structural brain markers of allostatic change from early adulthood to mid-life⁵⁰.

White matter (possible mechanism). The Framingham stroke risk score was the best candidate marker to predict white matter integrity, followed by metabolic syndrome and then the allostatic load index for fractional anisotropy, while for mean diffusivity it was metabolic syndrome or allostatic load index to an equal extent.

Vascular risk and stroke. The Framingham stroke risk score provides a clinically validated stroke risk profile based on the history and presence of cardiovascular risk factors, which in the present study was also associated with white matter structure. Vascular risk has been acknowledged to contribute widely to white matter changes appearing hyperintense on FLAIR images⁵¹⁻⁵³ and in relation to DTI measures⁵⁴. White matter changes have been linked to the pathology of stroke^{55,56}, dementia⁵⁷⁻⁵⁹, and risk of death⁶⁰. Around 25% of all strokes are accounted for by small vessel infarcts of the white matter^{27,61}. Cardiovascular risk factors such as type II diabetes are associated with small vessel disease⁶².

Vascular risk and dementia. Over time, brain-regulated sympathetic autonomic nervous system activity leads to the wear-and-tear of the cardiovascular system, which in turn affects brain regional vasodilation and vascular reactivity that are required for tasks and clearing of waste products. These in turn increase the risk of dementia⁶³.

The link between vascular factors and dementia is well known⁶⁴. Vascular factors manifest as white matter lesions and lacunes, and increase the clinical expression of dementia at a certain burden of Alzheimer pathology^{57,58,65}. Hypertension, smoking and hypercholesterolemia, which are part of the Framingham stroke risk score, are clinical risk factors for the clinical diagnosis of Alzheimer's disease and for the presence of Alzheimer pathology⁶⁶. Alzheimer pathology in the form of cerebral amyloidosis can affect vascular and endothelial function, which in turn might lead to impaired vascular mechanisms and clearing of abnormal proteins, such as amyloid, from the brain^{65,67}.

Strengths and limitations. Study strengths are the relatively large sample size, repeated measures of markers, and up-to-date imaging techniques. Limitations are the cross-sectional imaging design, the underrepresentation of females in this study sample and the lack of primary marker components in the allostatic load index. This sex imbalance is representative of the Whitehall II cohort at baseline⁶⁸, and at the recruitment phase (Phase 11). Sex differences in age trajectories of certain physiological disorders, such as cardiovascular and central obesity, are reflected in and accounted for in the Framingham and metabolic syndrome scores⁶⁹. While it would be possible to refine risk, e.g. allostatic load, by using sex-specific cut-offs, we limited our approach to using published, generally accepted definitions. The generation of a composite best predictor index would be possible given our data, but was outside the scope of this paper. Sex differences in subjective stress perception and multi-factorial physiological dysregulation through the lifespan have also been reported⁷⁰. However, due to a relatively higher vascular mortality rate amongst women that coincides with female reproductive decline, the sex gap in ill-health and mortality is reduced in postmenopausal age71. In addition, in the present analysis we used the sum of composite markers from two study phases, twenty and ten years prior to the scan, which reduced any statistical variability due to markers acquired pre-menopause. Components of the allostatic load index were also limited to secondary markers of the stress response, which might explain why the allostatic load index was not associated with brain regions that regulate the stress response, namely the prefrontal cortex, hippocampus, amygdala or hypothalamus.

Sex-balanced prospective longitudinal cohorts that concurrently measure changes in allostatic load markers and brain structure will help us understand the sex differences in age trajectories of physiological dysregulation and structural brain changes. In turn these can serve as risk factors for tertiary outcomes of allostatic overload, such as Alzheimer's disease and mortality⁹.

Future directions. Prospective cohort studies that longitudinally and concurrently assess stressors, the allostatic load index and brain structure are needed in order to tease apart the allostasis and allostatic load mechanisms, which are involved in ageing. Recent research focused on identifying the subtly abnormal patterns of brain ageing that precede cognitive decline and the development of Alzheimer's pathology⁷². Mechanisms in which composite stress markers come together to predict brain changes⁷³, cognitive decline⁷⁴, and what role gender plays in these⁷⁵, needs further clarification⁵⁰. Understanding the process that links allostatic load mechanisms to health outcomes and their multifactorial predictors, as well as disease trajectories before the illness develops, will benefit research into age-related and neurodegenerative diseases.

References

- 1. World Health Organization. Mental health and older adults, http://www.who.int/mediacentre/factsheets/fs381/en/ (2016).
- American Psychological Association. Stress in America. Paying With Our Health, https://www.apa.org/news/press/releases/ stress/2014/stress-report.pdf (2015).
- 3. Global Organization for Stress. Stress Facts, http://www.gostress.com/stress-facts/ (2017).
- World Health Organization. Prevalence of mental disorders., http://www.euro.who.int/en/health-topics/noncommunicable-diseases/ mental-health/data-and-statistics (2017).
- 5. Selye, H. What is stress? Metabolism 5, 525-530 (1956).
- 6. Epel, E. S. Psychological and metabolic stress: a recipe for accelerated cellular aging? Hormones (Athens) 8, 7–22 (2009).
- McEwen, B. S. Physiology and neurobiology of stress and adaptation: Central role of the brain. *Physiol Rev* 87, 873–904, https://doi. org/10.1152/physrev.00041.2006 (2007).
- 8. Zsoldos, E. & Ebmeier, K. P. In Stress: Concepts, Cognition, Emotion, and Behavior Handbook of Stress Series (ed G. Fink) 311–323, (Academic Press, 2016).
- Juster, R. P., McEwen, B. S. & Lupien, S. J. Allostatic load biomarkers of chronic stress and impact on health and cognition. *Neurosci Biobehav Rev* 35, 2–16, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.neubiorev.2009.10.002 (2010).
- Korte, S. M., Koolhaas, J. M., Wingfield, J. C. & McEwen, B. S. The Darwinian concept of stress: benefits of allostasis and costs of allostatic load and the trade-offs in health and disease. *Neurosci Biobehav Rev* 29, 3-38, https://doi.org/10.1016/j. neubiorev.2004.08.009 (2005).
- 11. Seeman, T. E., Singer, B. H., Rowe, J. W., Horwitz, R. I. & McEwen, B. S. Price of adaptation-allostatic load and its health consequences. MacArthur studies of successful aging. *Arch Intern Med* 157, 2259–2268 (1997).
- Goldman, N., Turra, C. M., Glei, D. A., Lin, Y. H. & Weinstein, M. Physiological dysregulation and changes in health in an older population. *Exp Gerontol* 41, 862–870, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.exger.2006.06.050 (2006).
- Karlamangla, A. S., Singer, B. H. & Seeman, T. E. Reduction in allostatic load in older adults is associated with lower all-cause mortality risk: MacArthur studies of successful aging. *Psychosom Med* 68, 500-507, https://doi.org/10.1097/01. psy.0000221270.93985.82 (2006).
- McEwen, B. S. & Gianaros, P. J. Central role of the brain in stress and adaptation: links to socioeconomic status, health, and disease. Ann N Y Acad Sci 1186, 190–222, https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1749-6632.2009.05331.x (2010).
- Lupien, S. J., McEwen, B. S., Gunnar, M. R. & Heim, C. Effects of stress throughout the lifespan on the brain, behaviour and cognition. Nat Rev Neurosci 10, 434–445, https://doi.org/10.1038/nrn2639 (2009).
- Chiappelli, J. et al. Allostatic load and reduced cortical thickness in schizophrenia. Psychoneuroendocrinology 77, 105–111, https:// doi.org/10.1016/j.psyneuen.2016.11.021 (2017).
- Savransky, A. et al. Fornix Structural Connectivity and Allostatic Load: Empirical Evidence from Schizophrenia Patients and Healthy Controls. Psychosom Med, https://doi.org/10.1097/PSY.000000000000487 (2017).
- Diniz, B. S. et al. Circulating biosignatures of late-life depression (LLD): Towards a comprehensive, data-driven approach to understanding LLD pathophysiology. J Psychiatr Res 82, 1–7, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpsychires.2016.07.006 (2016).
- Booth, T. *et al.* Association of allostatic load with brain structure and cognitive ability in later life. *Neurobiol Aging* 36, 1390–1399, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.neurobiolaging.2014.12.020 (2015).
- Ritchie, S. J. et al. Risk and protective factors for structural brain ageing in the eighth decade of life. Brain Struct Funct, https://doi. org/10.1007/s00429-017-1414-2 (2017).
- D'Agostino, R. B., Wolf, P. A., Belanger, A. J. & Kannel, W. B. Stroke risk profile: adjustment for antihypertensive medication. The Framingham Study. Stroke 25, 40–43 (1994).
- Ford, E. S., Li, C. & Sattar, N. Metabolic syndrome and incident diabetes: current state of the evidence. *Diabetes Care* 31, 1898–1904, https://doi.org/10.2337/dc08-0423 (2008).
- Allan, C. L. *et al.* Does the Framingham Stroke Risk Profile predict white-matter changes in late-life depression? *Int Psychogeriatr* 24, 524–531, https://doi.org/10.1017/S1041610211002183 (2012).
- Debette, S. *et al.* Midlife vascular risk factor exposure accelerates structural brain aging and cognitive decline. *Neurology* 77, 461–468, https://doi.org/10.1212/WNL.0b013e318227b227 (2011).
- Song, S. W. *et al.* Regional cortical thickness and subcortical volume changes in patients with metabolic syndrome. *Brain Imaging Behav* 9, 588–596, https://doi.org/10.1007/s11682-014-9311-2 (2015).
- Yates, K. F., Sweat, V., Yau, P. L., Turchiano, M. M. & Convit, A. Impact of metabolic syndrome on cognition and brain: a selected review of the literature. *Arterioscler Thromb Vasc Biol* 32, 2060–2067, https://doi.org/10.1161/ATVBAHA.112.252759 (2012).
- Segura, B. *et al.* Microstructural white matter changes in metabolic syndrome: a diffusion tensor imaging study. *Neurology* 73, 438–444, https://doi.org/10.1212/WNL.0b013e3181b163cd (2009).
- Seeman, T. E., McEwen, B. S., Rowe, J. W. & Singer, B. H. Allostatic load as a marker of cumulative biological risk: MacArthur studies of successful aging. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 98, 4770–4775, https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.081072698 (2001).
- Filippini, N. et al. Study protocol: The Whitehall II imaging sub-study. BMC Psychiatry 14, 159, https://doi.org/10.1186/1471-244X-14-159 (2014).
- 30. Chandola, T. *et al.* Work stress and coronary heart disease: what are the mechanisms? *Eur Heart J* 29, 640–648, https://doi.org/10.1093/eurheartj/ehm584 (2008).
- 31. Marmot, M. G. et al. Health inequalities among British civil servants: the Whitehall II study. Lancet 337, 1387-1393 (1991).
- Kivimaki, M. et al. Vascular risk status as a predictor of later-life depressive symptoms: a cohort study. Biol Psychiatry 72, 324–330, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biopsych.2012.02.005 (2012).
- Brunner, E. J. et al. Social inequality in coronary risk: central obesity and the metabolic syndrome. Evidence from the Whitehall II study. Diabetologia 40, 1341–1349, https://doi.org/10.1007/s001250050830 (1997).
- 34. Tabak, A. G. et al. Trajectories of glycaemia, insulin sensitivity, and insulin secretion before diagnosis of type 2 diabetes: an analysis from the Whitehall II study. Lancet 373, 2215–2221, https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736(09)60619-X (2009).
- Hamer, M., Venuraju, S. M., Urbanova, L., Lahiri, A. & Steptoe, A. Physical activity, sedentary time, and pericardial fat in healthy older adults. Obesity (Silver Spring) 20, 2113–2117, https://doi.org/10.1038/oby.2012.61 (2012).
- Expert Panel on Detection Evaluation and Treatment of High Blood Cholesterol In Adults (Adult Treatment Panel III). Third Report of The National Cholesterol Education Program (NCEP) - Executive Summary. JAMA 285, 2486–2497 (2001).

- Dich, N., Lange, T., Head, J. & Rod, N. H. Work stress, caregiving, and allostatic load: prospective results from the Whitehall II cohort study. *Psychosom Med* 77, 539–547, https://doi.org/10.1097/PSY.00000000000191 (2015).
- Smith, S. M. et al. Advances in functional and structural MR image analysis and implementation as FSL. Neuroimage 23(Suppl 1), S208–219, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.neuroimage.2004.07.051 (2004).
- Winkler, A. M., Ridgway, G. R., Webster, M. A., Smith, S. M. & Nichols, T. E. Permutation inference for the general linear model. *Neuroimage* 92, 381–397, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.neuroimage.2014.01.060 (2014).
- Smith, S. M. & Nichols, T. E. Threshold-free cluster enhancement: addressing problems of smoothing, threshold dependence and localisation in cluster inference. *Neuroimage* 44, 83–98, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.neuroimage.2008.03.061 (2009).
- 41. McEwen, B. S. Protective and damaging effects of stress mediators: central role of the brain. *Dialogues Clin Neurosci* 8, 367–381 (2006).
- Heinsius, T., Bogousslavsky, J. & Van Melle, G. Large infarcts in the middle cerebral artery territory. Etiology and outcome patterns. Neurology 50, 341–350 (1998).
- Hacke, W. et al. 'Malignant' middle cerebral artery territory infarction: clinical course and prognostic signs. Arch Neurol 53, 309–315 (1996).
- Huttner, H. B. & Schwab, S. Malignant middle cerebral artery infarction: clinical characteristics, treatment strategies, and future perspectives. *Lancet Neurol* 8, 949–958, https://doi.org/10.1016/S1474-4422(09)70224-8 (2009).
- Fotenos, A. F., Snyder, A. Z., Girton, L. E., Morris, J. C. & Buckner, R. L. Normative estimates of cross-sectional and longitudinal brain volume decline in aging and AD. *Neurology* 64, 1032–1039, https://doi.org/10.1212/01.WNL.0000154530.72969.11 (2005).
- McEwen, B. S. & Seeman, T. Protective and damaging effects of mediators of stress. Elaborating and testing the concepts of allostasis and allostatic load. Ann N Y Acad Sci 896, 30–47 (1999).
- Crimmins, E. M., Johnston, M., Hayward, M. & Seeman, T. Age differences in allostatic load: an index of physiological dysregulation. Exp Gerontol 38, 731–734 (2003).
- Hwang, A. C. *et al.* Predicting all-cause and cause-specific mortality by static and dynamic measurements of allostatic load: a 10-year population-based cohort study in Taiwan. J Am Med Dir Assoc 15, 490–496, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jamda.2014.02.001 (2014).
- Read, S. & Grundy, E. Allostatic load and health in the older population of England: a crossed-lagged analysis. *Psychosom Med* 76, 490–496, https://doi.org/10.1097/PSY.0000000000083 (2014).
- Gallo, L. C., Fortmann, A. L. & Mattei, J. Allostatic load and the assessment of cumulative biological risk in biobehavioral medicine: challenges and opportunities. *Psychosom Med* 76, 478–480, https://doi.org/10.1097/PSY.00000000000095 (2014).
- Debette, S. & Markus, H. S. The clinical importance of white matter hyperintensities on brain magnetic resonance imaging: systematic review and meta-analysis. BMJ 341, c3666, https://doi.org/10.1136/bmj.c3666 (2010).
- de Leeuw, F. E. et al. Prevalence of cerebral white matter lesions in elderly people: a population based magnetic resonance imaging study. The Rotterdam Scan Study. J Neurol Neurosurg Psychiatry 70, 9–14 (2001).
- de Groot, M. et al. Tract-specific white matter degeneration in aging: the Rotterdam Study. Alzheimers Dement 11, 321–330, https:// doi.org/10.1016/j.jalz.2014.06.011 (2015).
- Gons, R. A. et al. Hypertension is related to the microstructure of the corpus callosum: the RUN DMC study. J Alzheimers Dis 32, 623–631, https://doi.org/10.3233/JAD-2012-121006 (2012).
- Sullivan, P., Pary, R., Telang, F., Rifai, A. H. & Zubenko, G. S. Risk factors for white matter changes detected by magnetic resonance imaging in the elderly. Stroke 21, 1424–1428 (1990).
- 56. Pantoni, L., Garcia, J. H. & Gutierrez, J. A. Cerebral white matter is highly vulnerable to ischemia. *Stroke* 27, 1641–1646; discussion 1647 (1996).
- 57. Snowdon, D. A. et al. Brain infarction and the clinical expression of Alzheimer disease. The Nun Study. JAMA 277, 813–817 (1997).
- 58. Toledo, J. B. *et al.* Contribution of cerebrovascular disease in autopsy confirmed neurodegenerative disease cases in the National
- Alzheimer's Coordinating Centre. Brain 136, 2697–2706, https://doi.org/10.1093/brain/awt188 (2013).
 59. Ott, A., Breteler, M. M., van Harskamp, F., Stijnen, T. & Hofman, A. Incidence and risk of dementia. The Rotterdam Study. Am J Epidemiol 147, 574–580 (1998).
- Debette, S. et al. Association of MRI markers of vascular brain injury with incident stroke, mild cognitive impairment, dementia, and mortality: the Framingham Offspring Study. Stroke 41, 600–606, https://doi.org/10.1161/STROKEAHA.109.570044 (2010).
- Schneider, A. T. et al. Ischemic stroke subtypes: a population-based study of incidence rates among blacks and whites. Stroke 35, 1552–1556, https://doi.org/10.1161/01.STR.0000129335.28301.f5 (2004).
- Gouw, A. A. et al. On the etiology of incident brain lacunes: longitudinal observations from the LADIS study. Stroke 39, 3083–3085, https://doi.org/10.1161/STROKEAHA.108.521807 (2008).
- Moorhouse, P. & Rockwood, K. Vascular cognitive impairment: current concepts and clinical developments. *Lancet Neurol* 7, 246–255, https://doi.org/10.1016/S1474-4422(08)70040-1 (2008).
- 64. O'Brien, J. T. et al. Vascular cognitive impairment. Lancet Neurol 2, 89-98 (2003).
- 65. O'Brien, J. T. & Markus, H. S. Vascular risk factors and Alzheimer's disease. BMC Med 12, 218, https://doi.org/10.1186/s12916-014-0218-y (2014).
- 66. Petrovitch, H. *et al*. Midlife blood pressure and neuritic plaques, neurofibrillary tangles, and brain weight at death: the HAAS. Honolulu-Asia aging Study. *Neurobiol Aging* **21**, 57–62 (2000).
- Weller, R. O., Preston, S. D., Subash, M. & Carare, R. O. Cerebral amyloid angiopathy in the aetiology and immunotherapy of Alzheimer disease. Alzheimers Res Ther 1, 6, https://doi.org/10.1186/alzrt6 (2009).
- Marmot, M. & Brunner, E. Cohort Profile: the Whitehall II study. Int J Epidemiol 34, 251–256, https://doi.org/10.1093/ije/dyh372 (2005).
- Malik, S. et al. Impact of the metabolic syndrome on mortality from coronary heart disease, cardiovascular disease, and all causes in United States adults. Circulation 110, 1245–1250, https://doi.org/10.1161/01.CIR.0000140677.20606.0E (2004).
- Yang, Y. & Kozloski, M. Sex differences in age trajectories of physiological dysregulation: inflammation, metabolic syndrome, and allostatic load. J Gerontol A Biol Sci Med Sci 66, 493–500, https://doi.org/10.1093/gerona/glr003 (2011).
- Weden, M. M. & Brown, R. A. Historical and life course timing of the male mortality disadvantage in Europe. *Biodemography Social Biology* 53, 61–79 (2008).
- Franke, K., Ristow, M. & Gaser, C. & Alzheimer's Disease Neuroimaging, I. Gender-specific impact of personal health parameters on individual brain aging in cognitively unimpaired elderly subjects. Front Aging Neurosci 6, 94, https://doi.org/10.3389/ fnagi.2014.00094 (2014).
- Day, T. A. Defining stress as a prelude to mapping its neurocircuitry: no help from allostasis. Prog Neuropsychopharmacol Biol Psychiatry 29, 1195–1200, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pnpbp.2005.08.005 (2005).
- Gruenewald, T. L., Kemeny, M. E. & Aziz, N. Subjective social status moderates cortisol responses to social threat. Brain Behav Immun 20, 410–419, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.bbi.2005.11.005 (2006).
- Seeman, T. E., Singer, B., Wilkinson, C. W. & McEwen, B. Gender differences in age-related changes in HPA axis reactivity. Psychoneuroendocrinology 26, 225–240 (2001).

Acknowledgements

We thank all Whitehall II participants for their time, the Whitehall II staff at the University College London and the FMRIB staff, Wellcome Centre for Integrative Neuroimaging for their helpful collaboration. Work on the Whitehall II imaging sub-study was funded by the "Lifelong Health and Wellbeing" Programme Grant: "Predicting MRI abnormalities with longitudinal data of the Whitehall II Substudy" (UK Medical Research Council: G1001354, PI: KPE), and the HDH Wills 1965 Charitable Trust (Nr: 1117747, PI: KPE). AS-M receives research support from the US National Institutes of Health (R01AG013196, R01AG034454). MK is supported by the UK Medical Research Council (K013351), and the ESRC/NordForsk professional fellowship scheme. CEM and MJ are supported by the National Institute for Health Research (NIHR) Biomedical Research Centres (BRC) based at Oxford Health NHS Foundation Trust, and at Oxford University Hospitals Foundation Trust in partnership with the University of Oxford, respectively.

Author Contributions

E.Zs. reviewed the literature, designed the study, acquired, analysed and interpreted data, and wrote the manuscript, N.F. and A.M. acquired data, C.E.M., A.S.-M. and M.K. planned the study. M.J. and K.P.E. planned the study and analysed and interpreted data. All authors critically read the manuscript.

Additional Information

Supplementary information accompanies this paper at https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-018-24398-9.

Competing Interests: M.J. reports funding from Oxford University Innovations outside the submitted work. The other authors have no competing interests to declare.

Publisher's note: Springer Nature remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

Open Access This article is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License, which permits use, sharing, adaptation, distribution and reproduction in any medium or format, as long as you give appropriate credit to the original author(s) and the source, provide a link to the Creative Commons license, and indicate if changes were made. The images or other third party material in this article are included in the article's Creative Commons license, unless indicated otherwise in a credit line to the material. If material is not included in the article's Creative Commons license and your intended use is not permitted by statutory regulation or exceeds the permitted use, you will need to obtain permission directly from the copyright holder. To view a copy of this license, visit http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/.

© The Author(s) 2018