

LONDON
SCHOOL of
HYGIENE
& TROPICAL
MEDICINE



Roy, A; Eisenhut, M; Harris, RJ; Rodrigues, LC; Sridhar, S; Habermann, S; Snell, L; Mangtani, P; Adetifa, I; Lalvani, A; Abubakar, I (2014) Effect of BCG vaccination against Mycobacterium tuberculosis infection in children: systematic review and meta-analysis. *BMJ* (Clinical research ed), 349. g4643. ISSN 0959-8138 DOI: 10.1136/bmj.g4643

Downloaded from: <http://researchonline.lshtm.ac.uk/1846205/>

DOI: [10.1136/bmj.g4643](https://doi.org/10.1136/bmj.g4643)

Usage Guidelines

Please refer to usage guidelines at <http://researchonline.lshtm.ac.uk/policies.html> or alternatively contact researchonline@lshtm.ac.uk.

Available under license: <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/2.5/>

Appendix 2: Newcastle-Ottawa scale for assessing the quality of cohort studies

Study	Selection			Comparability	Outcome			Rating		Quality
	Information on age composition of childhood cohorts with information on BCG ^a	Ascertainment of immunisation status ^b	Demonstration that mycobacterium tuberculosis infection (determined by IGRA) was not present before the BCG immunisation was given ^c .		Comparability of cohorts on the basis of the design or analysis ^d	Assessment of infection with Mycobacterium tuberculosis by interferon gamma release assay ^e	Was interferon gamma release assay done long enough after exposure for infection to be detectable in both immunized and not immunized groups ^f	Adequacy of follow up of children exposed to the patient with tuberculosis ^g	Overall Star Ratings	
Adetifa et al 2010	B*	B*	B*	B*	D	C	C	4*	44	moderate
Altet-Gomez et al 2011	A*	B*	C	B*	A*	B	B*	5*	55	moderate
Bianchi et al 2009	A*	B*	C	B*	D	C	B*	4*	44	moderate
Domingues et al 2008	B*	B*	C	B*	D	C	B*	4*	44	moderate
Eisenhut et al 2009	B*	B*	C	A*B*	D	C	B*	5*	55	moderate
Eriksen et al 2010	A*	B*	C	A*B*	D	A*	A*	6*	67	high
Ewer et al 2003	B*	B*	C	B*	D	C	D	4*	44	moderate
Hill et al 2011	B*	B*	C	B*	D	C	D	3*	33	low
Neira-Munoz et al 2008	A*	B*	C	B*	D	C	B*	4*	44	moderate
Okada et al 2008	B*	B*	B*	A*B*	D	A*	A*	7*	77	high
Rutherford et al 2012	A*	B*	C	A*	D	C	C	3*	33	low
Soysal et al 2005	B*	B*	B*	A*B*	A*	C	B*	7*	77	high
Tsiouris et al 2006	B*	B*	C	B*	D	C	B*	4*	44	moderate
Tsolis et al 2010	C	C	C	A*B*	D	C	B*	3*	33	low

^aA Mean or median age provided*; B Age range provided*; C No information on age

^bA Secure immunisation record*; B BCG scar only or combination of good history and/or BCG scar and/or secure record*; C Written self report; D No description

^cA An IGRA test excluded infection with mycobacterium tuberculosis before BCG immunisation*; B BCG immunisation was given at birth as reported in publication*; C No demonstration of lack of mycobacterium tuberculosis infection before BCG immunisation.

^dA Study provided adjusted odds ratio by degree of exposure to infectious case and or age*; B Study provided odds ratio of infection*; C Survey without knowledge of exposure.

^eA Assesment of infection status blind to BCG vaccination status or record linkage (blind to vaccination status) as reported in publication*; B Record linkage not blind to vaccination status or not described*; C Self report; D No description

^fA Yes (at least 6 weeks) after exposure to infectious patient with mycobacterium tuberculosis*; B No; C Information not provided

^gA All children exposed were tested for infection*; B Similar losses to follow up in each group*; C Some children not tested and no description who was affected or there was an indeterminate result in more than 10% and not equally distributed; D No record of untested children or whether there were indeterminate results of testing